

د ادارى فساد پر وړاندې د څارنې او ارزونې
خپلواکه او گډه کمیټه



کمیټه مستقل مشترک نظارت و ارزیابی
مبارزه با فساد اداری

Independent Joint Anti-Corruption Monitoring and Evaluation Committee

MEC's Impact Analysis

Kabul, Afghanistan

October 2016

ABBREVIATIONS/ACRONYMS

ACD	Afghan Custom Department
AG	Attorney General
AGO	Attorney General's Office
AISA	Afghanistan Investment Support Agency
CTAP	Civilian Technical Assistance Program
DABS	Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat
MOCI	Ministry of Commerce and Industry
MOCIT	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology
MOEc	Ministry of Economy
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOHE	Ministry of Higher Education
MOHRA	Ministry of Haj and Religious Affairs
MOI	Ministry of Interior
MOJ	Ministry of Justice
MOLSAMD	Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled
MOMP	Ministry of Mines and Petroleum
MOPH	Ministry of Public Health
MORR	Ministry of Refugees and Repatriations
MSI	Management Systems International
NDS	National Directorate of Security
NUG	National Unity Government
SAO	Supreme Audit Office
VP	Vice President

Executive Summary

There is a harsh reality in Afghanistan. Corruption has increased during the last 15 years and the public has grown highly skeptical that it will ever be tackled. Allegations of deep corruption have surfaced in all sectors, but Afghanistan needs to solve this problem, and MEC is one of the key pieces of the solution.

This report examines the impact of MEC since its establishment in 2010. MEC has already had a significant impact on corruption in Afghanistan by taking action in four different areas:

1. In identifying **corruption vulnerabilities in government processes**, and pushing for correction of these weaknesses until the required changes have been made
2. In **public engagement** about major abuses, with comments based on solid research
3. In drafting **new laws and amendments** to existing laws to reduce corruption
4. Other ways such as the **influence of the MEC's prominent Committee Members** on anti-corruption landscape in the country

Correcting corruption vulnerabilities in government processes

Government Property

The Waqfi Land Registration by Ministry of Haj and Religious Affairs (MOHRA): As MEC's Public inquiry into Land Usurpation (November 2014) revealed, a huge part of *waqfi* land (land endowed for religious and public purposes) has been usurped by powerful people, municipalities and other government institutions. The lack of proper documentation of *waqfi* land by the Endowment Directorate of the MOHRA fostered the usurpation of *waqfi* land. MEC therefore issued three recommendations asking MOHRA to identify all the endowed land in Afghanistan. As a result of this effort, 39,989 jeribs of *waqfi* land have been identified and registered in 20 provinces.

Ministry of Refugees and Repatriations (MORR): The recommendations issued to MORR are based on the "VCA on the Land Distribution Process for Repatriates" as a result of which, the Regulation on the Activities and Operations of MORR has been developed to systematically regulate the scope of MORR work. Acting on MEC's recommendations, high-ranking officials of the Ministry who were involved in corruption were identified and their cases were referred to AGO.

Education Sector

Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE): Implementing MEC's recommendations, the MOHE created a unification of standard curriculum for all universities. MEC's VCA in this regard contributed to reformed structures of universities, provided market-based education, and led to the implementation of the credit system in all private and public universities. MEC's recommendations instigated simplified procedures for diploma distribution and the establishment of a one-stop shop for providing services. Furthermore, the new Higher Education Law has been enacted through Presidential Decree, which entails most of the provisions recommended by MEC.

Revenue Generating & Budgeting Sector

Ministry of Finance (MOF): On the basis of MEC's recommendations, MOF in close cooperation with MOEC and IDLG, developed the Provincial Budgeting Policy and conducted capacity building trainings in public financial management for all 34 provincial entities.

Ministry of Mines and Petroleum (MOMP): Encouraged by MEC, MOMP successfully amended the Minerals Law. The amendments include most of MEC's recommendations including: conflict of interest; anti-corruption clauses; community monitoring; and publication of all contracts and sub contracts.

Afghan Custom Department (ACD): Based on MEC's recommendations, a new Procedure for Customs Brokers, which includes addressing violation of Laws and Regulations, was developed.

Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat (DABS): Acting on MEC's recommendations, DABS developed and implemented an annual procurement plan. MEC also exerted public pressure on government institutions and "powerful people" that for years had not paid their electricity bills. According to DABS, that pressure led to massive political support for DABS and as a result they were able to recover AFN 500 million (approx. USD 7.3 million).

Law Enforcement

Attorney General's Office (AGO): The implementation of MEC's recommendations led to reforms within AGO such as the development of Terms of Reference for prosecutors and administrative staff. These ToRs detail staff responsibilities and prevent the illegal interference of other staff. Additionally, the Internal Appointment Committee is now vetting and examining new prosecutors, and all prosecutors are evaluated annually to ensure quality of performance. Moreover, training needs are identified, on the basis of the annual evaluation, to keep the system functioning efficiently.

Oversight Institutions

Supreme Audit Office (SAO): Findings of MEC substantiated widespread corruption in several institutions. With the full implementation of only five of the recommendations, SAO detected cases of wrongdoing, nepotism, and misappropriation. This led to, among other things, the President's order to dissolve Civilian Technical Assistance Program and merge Afghanistan Investment Support Agency with the MOCI.

Administrative Reforms

Reform in the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled (MOLSAMD): The MOLSAMD accepted the weaknesses of the M40 forms identified by MEC. The forms had previously allowed inheritors of retirees, disabled and martyrs receive payments beyond the legal timeframes. M40 forms were revised, and the number and age of inheritors were changed afterwards. The Ministry has saved several million dollars, and has taken disciplinary measures against provincial directors and other employees for not implementing the reform and not sharing the necessary information on time.

Public engagement

MEC speaks out publicly on cases of broad public interest. It usually does this via its respected Afghan Committee members, such as on the Smart City scandal earlier in 2016. It also does this on large scandals where the authorities are not giving the problem the attention it deserves.

Kabul Bank Case: To date, 45 of MEC's 48 recommendations (93 percent) have been implemented through relevant institutions. A total of USD 254 million has been collected from debtors by the Kabul Bank Receivership and transferred to Afghan Government.

Land Usurpation: MEC issued 18 recommendations in this regard and sent the report to the relevant ministries and independent directorates. MEC's follow-up of the recommendations indicates that approximately 50,000 jeribs of occupied land in Herat, Nangarhar, and Logar Provinces have been restored by law enforcement institutions and returned to the rightful owners.

Legal Projects, Drafts and Amendments:

MEC analyzes the legal framework of various entities, identifies contradictions, duplications, and deficiencies, and issues recommendations for suggested changes. MEC has drafted and amended two laws, both of which were submitted to Parliament; 1) a draft of Whistle Blower Protection Law (2015); and 2) the Draft of Lobbying Law. Furthermore, MEC's recommendations also contributed towards the development of Access to Information Law.

I. Introduction

This paper briefly summarizes the impact of MEC since its establishment in 2010. It analyses data and statistics to measure MEC's impact in anti-corruption efforts in Afghanistan. MEC has so far conducted: 13 VCAs; 23 research papers; four Special Reports; and issued 486 recommendations. However, the focus of this paper is not on what MEC has done, but rather the impact of its activities in the past six years.

It is noteworthy that MEC's impact is not limited merely to the implementation of the recommendations. Other factors such as the mere presence of MEC's influential Committee Members has also contributed to MEC's impact. The prominent Committee Members, through various meetings with President Ghani, CEO Abdullah, and other high ranking officials, are highly influential in shaping the anti-corruption landscape in Afghanistan.

The High Council for Law and Anti-Corruption, which is under the chairmanship of the President and the membership of the CEO, Vice President, Attorney General, Chief Justice, and Minister of Justice was established with the ambitious goal of rooting out corruption. Sardar Roshan, the President's Advisor on Transparency, has asserted that they rely on MEC's technical assistance to enhance the capability of the Council's Secretariat.

Having confidence in MEC, President Ghani has insisted several times, in MEC's participation in critical anti-corruption investigations including but not limited to E-Tazkira, MoCIT Tashkil, Assessment of Arya Township, and Assessment of National Labor Association's tangible and intangible assets.

II. Analysis

As a result of MEC's anti-corruption efforts, multiple Afghan organizations have undertaken reforms to address corruption more effectively. Some reforms have materialized due to the efforts of many organizations, not only due to MEC's push. However, MEC has added its voice to publicly pressure for certain entities to bring reforms. The following is a brief list of MEC's impact across different government institutions.

1. Government Property

The Waqfi Land Registration by Ministry of Haj and Religious Affairs (MOHRA): As MEC's Public Inquiry into Land Usurpation of November 2014 revealed, a huge part of *waqfi* land (land endowed for religious and public purposes) has been usurped by powerful people, municipalities and other government institutions. The lack of proper

documentation of *waqfi* land by the Endowment Directorate of the MOHRA fostered the usurpation of *waqfi* land.

MEC therefore issued three recommendations asking MOHRA to identify Afghanistan's endowed land in close cooperation with the relevant authorities, register the land with proper documentation and take measures to identify and retrieve the usurped land. The Endowment Directorate of MOHRA thus instructed its provincial departments through a circular in November 2015, to identify the documented and undocumented *waqfi* land in their respective provinces. A form was attached to the circular specifying the exact location of the land or property, name of the donor, date of endowment, type of the property and type of the documents. Twenty provinces established joint working committees in corporation with ARAZI, Cadaster and other involved institutions. They identified and registered the *waqfi* land by completing the forms and then reported back to the Ministry. As a result, 39,989 jeribs of *waqfi* land has been identified and registered in the 20 provinces – a large part of this land being in Kabul, Herat, Balkh, Takhar Samangan, Jozjan and Sare Pul Provinces. The documents of all undisputed land which is currently under the Ministry's control are now archived at the Directorate of Endowment. However, since a large part of the endowed land has been donated without the required deeds, there are a lot of disputes over the ownership of the property.

Ministry of Refugees and Repatriations (MORR): MEC's recommendations to the MORR are based on the *VCA on the Land Distribution Process for Repatriates*. A result of this is that the Regulation on the Activities and Operations of MORR has been developed to systematically regulate the scope of MORR work. Also, the Procedure for Land Distribution has been developed and MOUs have been signed with 13 institutions to manage the distribution of land for repatriates. Also as a result of the implementation of MEC's recommendations, high-ranking officials of the Ministry who were involved in corruption were identified and their cases were referred to AGO.

2. Education Sector

Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE): Acting on MEC's recommendations regarding university examination administration, the MOHE implemented the standard curriculum for all universities, which increased transparency and meritocracy in universities examinations and administration. MEC's VCA meaningfully contributed to reformed structures of universities, provided market-based education, and led to the implementation of the credit system in all private and public universities. The procedure for diploma distribution has been simplified and a one-stop shop for providing services has been established which considerably improved the provision of

services. Academic and administrative positions have been separated and vacant positions have been filled. The new Higher Education Law has been enacted through Presidential Decree, which entails most of the provisions recommended by MEC (e.g., hiring conditions for university lecturers, academic accountability of the lecturers, etc.)

3. Revenue Generation & Budgeting Sector

Ministry of Finance (MOF): MEC asked the MOF to develop a Provincial Budgeting Policy and strengthen capacity of provincial development committees so that they can actively participate in the budgeting process. On the basis of the recommendation, MOF in close cooperation with MOEc and IDLG, developed the Provincial Budgeting Policy and conducted capacity building trainings in public financial management for all 34 provincial entities.

Ministry of Mines and Petroleum (MOMP): Encouraged by MEC, MOMP successfully amended the Minerals Law. The amendments reflect most of MEC's recommendations including: confidentiality of documents; conflict of interest; anti-corruption clauses; community monitoring; and publication of all contracts and sub contracts. MOMP also conducted a human resources needs assessment and provided trainings to its employees based on the results of the assessment.

Afghan Custom Department (ACD): Based on MEC's recommendations, a new Procedure for Customs Brokers, which includes addressing violation of Laws and Regulations, was developed. Additionally, a procedure for obtaining a broker license and legal documents for tax exemption was developed with the recommended provisions. Further, a monitoring unit has been established to control and monitor broker activities in order to systematically update the broker blacklist.

Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat (DABS): Acting on MEC's recommendations, DABS developed and implemented an annual procurement plan. Adhering to this new plan, DABS signed 28 contracts in 1393 (2014). In addition, 11 extra contracts were signed in the same year with the financial assistance of USAID, with a total contract value of \$281.5 million. At the same time, DABS has developed and implemented an asset management policy which covers the recording of all inventories, stock management and the management of fixed assets. MEC also publically put pressure on government institutions and "powerful people" that for years had not paid their electricity bills. According to DABS, that pressure led to massive political support for DABS and as a result they were able to recover AFN 500 million (approx. USD 7.3 million).

Afghanistan Investment Support Agency (AISA) and Ministry of Commerce and Industry (MOCI): MEC asked AISA to clarify its legal status to ensure transparency and

accountability. The issue became complicated and it was later addressed by the National Unity Government (NUG). NUG decided to merge AISA with the MOCI. As a result of this decision, the responsibility of industrial parks will most likely transfer to the MOCI. Moreover, as recommended by MEC, AISA now publicizes all the resolutions and decisions made by High Commission of Investment on its website. In addition, AISA's budget and expenditure received more scrutiny and even came under SAO audits as a result of MEC pressure.

4. Law Enforcement Institutions

Attorney General's Office (AGO): There has long been complaints from Afghans regarding widespread corruption within law enforcement institutions, especially the AGO. The former Legal Advisor to President, Abdul Ali Mohammadi, and Special Representative of the President for Good Governance, Zia Masood, have both bitterly criticized AGO's underperformance and corruption. After the meeting of the Attorney General (AG) with the MEC Committee Members, the AG pointed out major problems facing AGO, which makes corruption difficult to stop. One of the challenges the AG mentioned is a dysfunction system whereby there is an assignment of too few qualified individuals for a large number of tasks. The implementation of MEC's recommendations led to reforms within AGO such as the development of Terms of Reference for prosecutors and administrative staff. These ToRs detail staff responsibilities and prevent the illegal interference of other staff. Additionally, the Internal Appointment Committee is now vetting and examining new prosecutors, and all prosecutors are evaluated annually to ensure quality of performance. Moreover, training needs are identified, on the basis of the annual evaluation, to keep the system functioning efficiently.

5. Oversight Institutions

Supreme Audit Office (SAO): Findings of MEC substantiated widespread corruption in several institutions such as: Ministry of Refugee and Repatriation (MoRR); Afghanistan Reconstruction and Development Services (ARDS); Afghanistan Investment Support Agency (AISA); and the Civilian Technical Assistance Program (CTAP). Based on the findings, MEC issued 12 recommendations to SAO to audit these institutions. With the full implementation of only five of the recommendations, SAO detected cases of wrongdoing, nepotism, and misappropriation. This led to among other things, the President's order to dissolve CTAP and merge AISA with the MOCI.

6. Administrative Reforms

Reform in the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled (MOLSAMD):

MOLSAMD had accepted the weaknesses of the M40 forms which were identified by the two VCAs conducted by MEC. The M40 forms, which are processed and archived manually, allow that inheritors of retirees, disabled and martyrs receive payments beyond the legal timeframes. Many of the forms were improperly revised, using handwritten changes, for instance in the age of inheritors. There was no mechanism in place to specify whether or not the spouse of the beneficiary is still alive and whether the children are of full age, graduated or married. Thus, the beneficiaries can wrongly receive continuing payments.

The Internal Audit Department of MOLSAMD had drafted an anti-corruption proposal to address these shortcomings. This proposal was reviewed by an internal committee which suggested short- and long-term solutions. As a short-term solution, the Ministry initiated a review and updates of the M40 forms and digitalized the forms by entering all the data into Management Systems International (MSI). Subsequently, MOLSAMD sent a circular to its provincial directorates asking for detailed information regarding the amount of money saved as a result of the reform and the full identities of all ineligible beneficiaries receiving payments.

According to the most current information received from 15 provinces, Afn 150.5 million (approx. USD 2.2 million) was saved in the first three quarters of 1394 (2015). The Ministry is still in the process of gathering the information from its provincial offices and has taken disciplinary measures against provincial directors and other employees for not implementing the M40 reform and not sharing the necessary information on due time. Also, the Ministry has submitted two cases from Takhar and Laghman Provinces to the AGO.

As mentioned above, changes to the M40 form is a short-term interim solution. For a long-term solution however, the whole application, registration and documentation system of the Ministry needs to be digitalized.

7. Special Reports

Special Reports are produced employing international experts and MEC's Technical Secretariat. Details of MEC's four Special Reports are as follows:

Kabul Bank Case: MEC's *Special Report on the Public Inquiry into the Kabul Bank Crisis* was released in November 2012. The Report had 48 recommendations which were directed to a number of government institutions and the international community, and these were targeted at resolving outstanding Kabul Bank issues, and correcting structural governance and justice sector deficiencies in Afghanistan. To date, 45 (93 percent) of the 48 recommendations have been implemented by relevant institutions. A

total of USD 254 million has been collected from debtors by the Kabul Bank Receivership and transferred to Afghan Government.

Land Usurpation: Impunity and the lack of rule of law contribute greatly to the land usurpation problem. According to the Ministry of Interior Affairs, the Directorate of Discovering Economic Crimes directed all subordinate units in the capital and in the provinces to present lists of usurped lands with the names of usurpers. A report provided by the Directorate indicated that in total 1,247,981 jeribs of government and private land have been usurped by 15,831 usurpers in 30 provinces.

MEC's findings reveal that most private and government land was usurped by those who have, or have had, a significant presence in the government. Law enforcement agencies have been ineffective in investigating and prosecuting land usurpation cases.

MEC prepared the Special Report issuing 18 recommendations and sent the Report to the relevant ministries and independent directorates. MEC's follow-up of the recommendations indicates that approximately 50,000 jeribs of occupied land in Herat, Nangarhar, and Logar Provinces have been restored by law enforcement institutions and returned to the rightful owners.

Aid Effectiveness: MEC reviewed three U.K.-funded projects; three each for Norway, the European Union, and Japan; and two for the United States. The projects were quite diverse, ranging from road construction to emergency humanitarian assistance. In addition, MEC studied the extensive literature on other projects, drawing upon the work of academics and oversight organizations to present a broader picture of the subject. Overall, 16 recommendations were issued, none of which have been completely implemented. However, 75 percent of the recommendations were partially implemented. Due to non-responsiveness and incomplete implementation of the recommendations, MEC does not have evidence to prove any substantial impact in this area.

Ministry of Public Health (MOPH): As requested by the Minister of Public Health, Dr. Feroz, MEC's latest Special Report, released in June 2016, focused on key aspects of the health sector. The research for the Report was conducted in 13 provinces, involved interviews with 270 people from five distinct groups of stakeholders: the existing and former MOPH Directors and Managers; non-management employees and frontline staff; leaders from all parts of the country; other stakeholders; and beneficiaries. This Report included 115 specific recommendations, prioritized by short, medium, and long term importance. These recommendations are meant to strengthen coordination and

cooperation within the health sector, and between the health sector and other sectors with the ultimate goal of bringing better healthcare to patients and their families. On a quarterly basis MEC will closely monitor the progress of the implementation of these recommendations, measure the impact, and release public reports.

8. Law Projects, Drafts and Amendments

MEC analyzes the legal framework of various entities, identifies the contradictions, duplications and deficiencies, and issues recommendations for suggested changes to existing laws. To that end, MEC has drafted a number of anti-corruption related laws. Enactment of these laws reforms the policies and mechanisms currently in place, and makes the fight against corruption more effective. The following is the list of legislation instigated by MEC.

Laws Submitted to Parliament

MEC has drafted and amended two laws, both were submitted to Parliament; draft of Whistle Blower Protection Law (2015); and the Draft of Lobbying Law. These activities are strengthening rule of law in Afghanistan through MEC's legal expertise. To illustrate, the following is a brief explanation of MEC's role in developing the Whistle Blower Protection Law.

Legislative Process of the Whistle Blower Protection Law

MEC had initiated drafting the Whistle Blower Protection Law in accordance with Article 33 of the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) which obligates all members to "incorporate into its domestic legal system appropriate measures to provide protection against any unjustified treatment for any person who reports in good faith and on reasonable grounds to the competent authorities any facts concerning offences established in accordance with this Convention." The draft Law has 9 Chapters and 51 Articles and will provide the required protection and encourage the reporting of misconduct, fraud and corruption.

The drafting of this law had been completed and sent to the Parliament's Anti-Corruption Caucus (PACC) through an official letter dated November 1, 2015, for the legislative process. The PACC has finalized the draft Whistle Blowers Protection Law in both Dari and Pashto languages. The draft law will soon be presented as a members' bill to the National Assembly for their approval.

The implementation of the Law, preventing abuse of its provisions for personal disputes and the practical protection of the reporting persons will be the next challenges for the

government. MEC will monitor the legislative process of the law and provide inputs if necessary.

Access to Information Law

MEC recommended a draft of Access to Information Law supported by broadest possible group of stakeholders, including civil society, media, MOIC, MOJ, MOF, MOEc, MOCIT, MOI, AGO, Independent Human Rights Commission and NDS. The President endorsed the Access to Information Law on December 1, 2014. Based on Article 6 of the Access to Information Law, relevant institutions are obligated to provide the requested information to the applicants within ten working days. This timeline could be extended for three more days if there is a legitimate reason. Institutions are obligated to provide the requested information to the media within three working days. Relevant institutions are obligated to provide the requested information within 24 hours in case the information is deemed necessary for the security of a person, personal life or freedom.

III. Stakeholder Views

In February 2016, MEC conducted a survey of its stakeholder's to determine their view of MEC's impact. A total of 35 stakeholders were identified for the survey which included government ministries and general directorates, semi-governmental institutions like Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat, international organizations, Civil Society Organizations, media, and national and international research institutions.

When asked about their view of MEC, 64 percent of stakeholders responded that MEC is doing well and is effective in fight against corruption. Stakeholders' responses on other questions were:

- 84 percent believed that "MEC should comment regularly on the state of anti-corruption efforts" to be more impactful;
- 41 percent pointed out that "MEC should expand its structure and size in order to better fight corruption"
- 35 percent believed that "MEC is effective on anti-corruption efforts"
- 22 percent said that people do not know about MEC due to its lack of public outreach
- 10 percent indicated that "unclear legal status of MEC is a principle challenge for MEC"
- 26 percent suggested that "MEC should broadly focus across the whole country
- 22 percent were of the view that "MEC should narrowly focus on some key ministries and agencies"
- 39 percent believed that "MEC is very effective on monitoring the implementation of anti-corruption recommendations and publishing regular reports"

The overall findings of the survey imply satisfaction and suggest that MEC is doing well and should further expand its activities.

IV. Conclusion

Since it was established, MEC has been an effective body in the fight against corruption in Afghanistan. Despite the general negative public perception of anti-corruption failures and MEC being part of it, there has been measurable, albeit nominal, progress in this area.

MEC has addressed and will continue to address the shortcomings highlighted by stakeholders. For instance, acknowledging needed change in communication, MEC has adopted a new Communication Plan, with a new approach. Also, as part of the new Strategic Plan, MEC will comment on the general state of anti-corruption more often and beyond the areas covered under its current M&E framework. MEC also plans to be more collaborative with others in Afghanistan who fight against corruption.

With both the new Communications and Strategic Plans, MEC's new firm legal status and the NUG leadership's continued support of MEC efforts, the organization remains committed and confident to have an even greater impact in the fight against corruption in the years to come.

Annex

Following the London Conference in 2010, MEC was created as an independent, joint anti-corruption committee to monitor and evaluate the fight against corruption both by GIRoA and international community in Afghanistan. The Committee is comprised of six members, three national and three international, experts in anti-corruption, and selected through a nomination process, overseen by GIRoA and international community. The Committee has four missions in Kabul annually, during which members meet with GIRoA, International Community, and other stakeholder officials and on the basis decisions are made and projects developed which are given to Secretariat for implementation.

MEC's mandate is to: 1) develop anti-corruption benchmarks; 2) monitor and evaluate the anti-corruption efforts of the Afghan government and the international community; and 3) report on a regular basis to the President, Parliament, and people of Afghanistan, as well as to the international community, about the state of the fight against corruption. To fulfill the mandate, MEC has developed four units within the Secretariat: Vulnerability to Corruption Assessment (VCA); Research; Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E); and Communication and Outreach.

So far, MEC has conducted 13 VCAs, published 25 research papers, issued 486 recommendations, held 20 press conferences, and released 10 Six-Month Reports. Additionally, MEC conducts significant in-depth Special Reports. Being successful and welcomed by GIRoA, International Community, and other stakeholders, MEC's Committee decided, in April 2016, to con

Work by Unit

- 1. Vulnerability to Corruption Assessments (VCAs):** In total MEC has published 13 VCAs on a variety of governmental entities and processes; University Examination Administration, Education Certificate Issuance, Civil Service Appointments Process, Pension Administration Reform, Land Distribution Process for Repatriates, Pharmaceutical Importation, Corruption Case Tracking, Martyrs' Salary Distribution in MOLSAMD, Wasaeq, Ministry of Education Teacher Recruitment, E-Tazkira, EQUIP MOE, and MOE Food Distribution Process.
- 2. Research:** The Research Unit has completed 23 research projects; Hiring Procedures within the Attorney General Office, Supreme Audit Office Assessment, Afghanistan Telecom Regulatory Authority, Criminalization of Civil Disputes, Security Sector Oversight Paper, Breshna Analysis, ARAZI Assessment, National Military Hospital Report, Asset Verification and Practices, Red Crescent Practices, Customs tax exemptions, Customs / pro forma, Ministry of Education Corruption Cases in Food Distribution, Ministry of Interior Food Survey, Mining Paper, Nepotism in Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Anti-Corruption Strategies

Review, Misuse of Government Vehicles, Blacklist Guidelines for Companies in Afghanistan , ACAA Report, Corruption in the Sports Community, and Conflict of Interest Report.

In addition, the Research Unit sent a case (UNHCR case) to the Attorney General's Office in Vienna. Publication of those reports through the media helped to increase public awareness towards anti-corruption activities, and the public informed that MEC does not only focus on national, but also focuses on international entities.

3. Monitoring & Evaluation Unit: Since its establishment, MEC has issued 486 recommendations to those entities which have been assessed in MEC reports. All recommendations have been monitored by M&E in relevant ministries and independent directorates. In total, 201 (41 percent) recommendations have been fully implemented, 156 (32 percent) recommendations have been partially implemented, 36 (7.5 percent) recommendations have not been implemented, 23 (5 percent) recommendations are outdated, and 70 (14.5 percent) recommendations have been recently issued and will be followed up for their status . The table on the next page (Recommendations and Impact) provides some examples of M&E's work.

4. Communication and Public Outreach:

Press conferences: MEC has held more than 20 press conferences in Kabul, with 10-20 media participating in each. The media broadcasted MEC's press conferences on multiple TV channels and hundred thousands of Afghan citizens have watched these question and answer sessions focusing on anti-corruption efforts in the country.

Publications: MEC has released 10 Six-Month Reports that are printed and distributed to government entities, Civil Society Organizations, universities, etc. MEC has also released four Special Reports covering Kabul Bank Crisis, Land Usurpation, Aid Effectiveness, and Ministry of Public Health. Additionally, MEC has released 13 VCAs and Research Papers covering a variety of public services and ministries. Based on MEC's website download statistics and social media monitoring, MEC's reports have been downloaded, on average, 2,000 times a month.

Recommendations and Impact

No.	Institution	Recommendations	Implemented	Partially Implemented	Not Implemented
1	Attorney General Office	16	7	9	0
2	Supreme Court	14	0	4	10
3	Supreme Audit Office	12	5	5	2
4	High Office of Oversight and Anti-Corruption	30	2	7	21
5	Ministry of Mines and Petroleum	21	7	14	0
6	Afghan Custom Department	15	7	8	0
7	National Procurement Authority	13	5	8	0
8	Ministry of Public Health (Pharmaceutical Import Report)	20	6	14	0
9	Ministry of Higher Education	38	28	8	2
10	Ministry of Refugees and Repatriates	11	9	2	0
11	MOLSAMD	15	12	3	0
12	Independent Administrative Reform and Civil Service Commission	39	24	13	2
13	Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat	4	3	1	0

14	Ministry of Finance	9	4		5
15	AISA and Ministry of Commerce and Industry	7	2	5	0
16	Afghan Red Crescent Society	2	2		
17	Independent Election Commission	7	5		2
18	ARAZI	15		15	
19	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology	6	1	1	4
21	Ministry of Education	10		6	4
22	Ministry of Economy	13	5	6	2
23	Ministry of Energy and Water	2	2	0	0
24	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	2		2	
25	Ministry of Hajj and Religious Affairs	8	6	2	0
26	Ministry of Information and Culture	4	1	3	0
27	Ministry of Justice	1	0	1	0
28	Ministry of Mines and Petroleum	21	14	7	
29	Parliamentary Anti-Corruption Caucus	1	0	1	0
30	Municipalities	2	2	0	0