

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
1	Enactment of an Access to Information Law providing broad access to information consistent with the Afghan Constitution	1.1	MOIC	Law requires state departments to grant the citizens of Afghanistan access to information without limit except when harming the rights of others or public security.	(15 Dec. 2013) - The draft Access to Information Law provides broad access to information for the citizens of Afghanistan but the draft law still needs to be processed (passed by the Council of Ministers, approved by the National Assembly, endorsed by the President, promulgated in the official gazette and enacted).	(30 June 2015) - Afghan President has endorsed the Access to Information Law on 01 Dec. 2014. The Law has six chapters and 32 articles.
2	Development of access to information legislation with participation from relevant government and civil society stakeholders	2.1	MOIC	Draft Access to Information Law supported by broadest possible group of stakeholders, including civil society, media, MOIC, MOJ, MOF, MOEC, MOCIT, MOI, AGO, Independent Human Rights Commission and NDS.		(30 June 2015) - All stakeholders including governmental institutions and Civil Society Organizations were involved in the development of the Access to Information Law.
3	Appropriate timelines for the processing of requests and provision of information	3.1	MOIC	Access to Information Law stipulates requirement for request to be processed in a timely manner and are adhered to by institutions receiving such requests.	(15 Dec. 2013) - The draft Access to Information Law still needs to be passed by the Council of Ministers, approved by the National Assembly, endorsed by the President and enacted.	(30 June 2015) - Based on Article 6 of the Access to Information Law, relevant institutions are obligated to provide the requested information to the applicants within ten working days. This timeline could be extended for three more days if there is a legitimate reason. Relevant institutions are obligated to provide the requested information to the media within three working days. Relevant institutions are obligated to provide the requested information within 24 hours in case the information is deemed necessary for the security of a person, personal life or freedom.
4	Sufficient penalties and sanctions for violations to access to information requirements	4.1	MOIC	Application of the Neglect of Duty clause under the Anti-Corruption Law as a penalty for non-compliance.	(15 Dec. 2013) - The draft Access to Information Law still needs to be passed by the Council of Ministers, approved by the National Assembly, endorsed by the President and enacted.	(31 Dec. 2015) - According to Access to Information Law, Article (26), the following are considered violations of the Law: 1) Providing information contrary to the application form; 2) Declining to provide information to applicants, without legitimate reason; 3) Providing false information to the Oversight Commission of Access to Information; 4) Not providing information in the specified timeline. According to paragraph 2 of this article, the Oversight Commission of Access to Information can declare a verbal warning, written warning or proposal of salary deduction to address the violations enshrined in §1.
		4.2	MOIC	Legislation provides penalties and administrative sanctions (official warnings, fines, demotion, dismissal) for officials who do not comply with the law requirements or enforce it accordingly.	(15 Dec. 2013) - There are no penalties or administrative sanctions in the draft Access to Information Law	(30 June 2015) - According to §2 of Article 26 of the Access to Information Law, the Oversight Commission of Access to Information can declare a verbal warning, written warning or proposal of salary deduction to address the violations enshrined in §1 of Article 26.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
5	Accessible and transparent dispute resolution mechanism	5.1	MOIC	Establishment of a representative committee for dispute resolution and for the administration of the law.	(15 Dec. 2013) - Based on the draft Access to Information Law, a commission for the oversight of access to information will be established with 11 particular responsibilities including dealing with complaints.	(30 June 2015) - Based on Article 16 of the Law, the Oversight Commission of Access to Information was officially established on June 14th to implement the Law. The Commission is composed of representatives of MOIC, MOCIT, MOFA, NDS, AIHRC, AIBA, the Lawyers Association, the Journalists Association (two representatives), political parties (two representatives), CSOs (two representatives) and ACCI. All members, except the representatives of the political parties, were introduced on June 22th 2015 and the Minister has officially introduced the Committee.
6	UNCAC self-assessments conducted to assess current legal framework against UNCAC requirements	6.1	HOO	Afghanistan UNCAC self-assessment published	(15 Dec. 2013) - Appointed Committee has prepared the report and submitted it to the UNCAC Secretariat. Afghanistan UNCAC Self-Assessment published and is available on the UNCAC website.	(30 June 2015) - While publication of the self-assessment report is optional, Afghanistan allowed its publication and it is now available on the UNCAC website.
7	Enactment of Property Dealer Law	7.1	MOJ	Property Dealer Law enacted and enforced effectively	(15 Dec. 2014) - The amendments to the Property Dealer Law are under MOJ consideration. However, it is currently on hold because priority has been given to other laws.	(31. Dec. 2015) - The new Property Dealer Law has been enacted and published in the official Gazette Nr. 1189 on 17th of October 2015.
8	Waqfi land (allocated land for public interest) surveyed and registered all over Afghanistan	8.1	MOHRA	Waqfi lands identified and registered and usurpation of Waqfi land prohibited		(31 Dec. 2015) - Based on MOHRA's report, the total number of Waqfi Land is approx. 58,000 jerib. Of this number some 34,000 have been usurped in different provinces. MOHRA was able to recover about 9,000 jerib with the support of involved authorities. List of the usurped Waqfi Land has been shared with MEC.
9	Information on land usurpation, prohibition of land usurpation according to Islam and the negative impact of land usurpation provided to people all over Afghanistan through mosques and religious scholars	9.1	MOHRA/ARAZI	A nationwide religious campaign by MOHRA in close cooperation with ARAZI and MOIC conducted	(15 Dec. 2014) - MOHRA established a committee composed of relevant directors for the implementation of MEC's recommendations. The committee has discussed MEC's recommendations. MOIC has declared its willingness to broadcast the religious scholars' speeches if the required budget is provided to the Ministry.	(30 June 2015) - MOHRA has established a training centre (Tadribul Umah) in Kabul to provide training for mullahs on how to raise public awareness from an Islamic perspective. Mullahs are instructed by MOHRA on a weekly basis to cover specific topics at the Friday prayers including anti-corruption themes and prohibition of land usurpation from Islamic perspective.
10	Legislation developed with broad consultation of relevant government and civil society organizations	10.1	MEC	Broad consultation conducted with full participation of HOO, MOI, NDS, AGO, MOJ, MOIC and CSOs	(15 Dec. 2013) - MEC is drafting a Whistle-blower Protection Law and will consult stakeholders as needed.	(30 June 2015) - MEC has conducted two consultation sessions with CSOs and Government stakeholders to further improve the draft law.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
11	Protection for whistleblowers from adverse consequences of their disclosures	11.1	MEC	Legislation includes provisions that prevents legal or other actions from being taken against whistleblowers	(15 Dec. 2013) - MEC is drafting a Whistle-blower Protection Law.	(30 June 2015) - Although the spirit of the entire Law is the protection of Whistle-Blowers, Chapter 4 titled "Protections for Reporting Persons" of the draft Law particularly covers the Prohibition on "Revealing Identity of Reporting Person" and "Preservation of Rights and Denial of Liabilities"
12	A working group of major donors engaged in anti-corruption programming established and meeting regularly	12.1	International Community	Terms of reference providing for coordination mechanism developed and approved.	(15 Dec. 2013) - The working group of major donors established and the "Anti-Corruption Small Group," chaired by the UK (DFID), approved its terms of reference on January 30, 2013.	(30 June 2015) - ICTAWG established and meets on a regular basis.
		12.2	International Community	Regular meetings are held with the participation of USA (USAID), United Kingdom (DIFID), EU, Germany, Japan, India, ISAF and UNAMA.	(15 Dec. 2013) - The working group convenes its meetings regularly on a monthly basis or as needed depending on international coordination at the policy and program level on anti-corruption in Afghanistan.	(30 June 2015) - Working group meets on a monthly basis and ad-hoc when needed. Since the ISAF Mission has already completed, the meetings are joined by the successor Mission (RSM).
		12.3	International Community	Anti-corruption programming and activities are implemented with consideration of other initiatives undertaken by donors		(30 June 2015) - There are numerous coordination forums that meet regularly, as discussed above, that should prevent duplication. No major duplication issues have been seen.
13	Comparative assessment of the effectiveness of on- and off-budget funded projects conducted and lessons learned applied to future funding	13.1	International Community	Key donors, namely USA (USAID), United Kingdom (DIFID), EU, Germany, Japan India, and ISAF cooperate with MEC in the review of select donor implemented projects	(19 Mar. 2014) - MEC is working on a report on aid effectiveness covering both off- and on-budget projects, but it is not completed and published yet.	(30 June 2015) - Key donors, including USA (USAID), United Kingdom (DIFID), EU, and Japan is cooperating with MEC in the review of select donor implemented projects.
14	All development projects funded in Afghanistan are registered with the Afghan government and published	14.1	International Community	All donors register all their projects in the DAD (MOF)	(15 Dec. 2013) - The DAD established by the MOF is identified as the central (and official) aid information-management system and an effective tool for aid accounting and reporting in Afghanistan.	(30 June 2015) - Until 2013, MOF had registered 34 Donors in the DAD. The registration process was completed in 2015 and covers all 54 donors with details of their projects. MEC Secretariat has seen the DAD online which includes names of all donors, title and code of each project, implementation year, amount of money, location and objective of the project etc.
		14.2	International Community	Donors publish key information of their projects, including project name, partners, cost, status, and location, on their websites		(30 June 2015) - Major donors generally make this information widely available as well as M&E reports conducted internally and by external evaluators.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
15	Appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms developed and implemented for all funds, including security sector spending	15.1	International Community	Donors develop monitoring and evaluation policies that take into account environmental factors unique to Afghanistan including lack of the security and remoteness	(15 Dec. 2013) - There is no nationwide monitoring and evaluation mechanism within the government of Afghanistan but establishing the DAD could be the first step taken in this regard.	(30 June 2015) - Donors are generally taking environmental factors into account. USAID for example is funding a program designed to promote increased scrutiny of field level activities.
16	Monitoring and evaluation results publicly reported	16.1	International Community	All monitoring and evaluation reports published on donor websites		(30 June 2015) - Major donors make internal and external evaluations available, including USAID and DFID.
17	Case management governance structures established and operational to enhance cooperation amongst law enforcement agencies	17.1	AGO	The steering committee meets regularly	(15 Dec. 2013) - The CMS Committee schedules their meetings every 15 days	(30 June 2015) - The Steering Committee meets once a month.
18	A revised Law on the Structure and Authority of the AGO clearly setting out the process and qualifications for the appointment of prosecutors	18.1	AGO	Procedures regarding the hiring and appointment of prosecutors are developed in conformity with the Civil Servants Law and Civil Service Commission procedures	(15 Dec. 2013) - The AGO has its own regulations stipulating the conditions for hiring prosecutors, but it is not in conformity with the Civil Servants Law.	(30 June 2015) - According to the official letter of the AGO, the recruitment of the administrative staff has been conducted in accordance with the Civil Servants Law and in cooperation with the IARCSC since 1392. Prosecutors are appointed after precise evaluation and examination by the internal appointment committee in accordance with Article 28 of the Law on the Structure and Authority of AGO.
		18.2	AGO	All newly recruited prosecutors are assessed against pre-determined qualifications relevant to the terms of reference for the position that they are being considered for	(15 Dec. 2013) - There are no terms of reference for the newly recruited prosecutors. The AGO has its own regulations for hiring prosecutors, but they are not in conformity with the Civil Servants Law.	(30 June 2015) - AGO has developed and finalized TORs for prosecutors and administrative staff. TOR of the Investigation Department, Directorate of Elimination of Violence against Women, Directorate of Human Resources and ToRs of the General Directorate of Kabul Appeal Attorney, Directorate of Oversight of Verdict Enforcement are prepared and finalized. A copy of the TORs have been shared with MEC. Additionally,
19	Comprehensive capacity building program for prosecutors introduced	19.1	AGO	Capacity of current group of prosecutors systematically assessed to identify training needs	(15 Dec. 2013) - The AGO has recently drafted a plan which identifies the training needs for prosecutors	(30 June 2015) - All prosecutors are evaluated annually and based on the result of their performance review, trainings needs are identified. A copy of the Evaluation Form of the prosecutors has been shared with MEC Secretariat
		19.2	AGO	Capacity training developed and implemented with the support of donors based on the assessed need	(15 Dec. 2013) - A lot of training programs have been provided for prosecutors by donors without taking into consideration AGO assessments or needs, and have not been considered effective so far.	(30 June 2015) - Based on the annual evaluation, training needs are identified and discussed in the annual Donor Meeting (JSSP, IDLO, UNDC, MAX PLANCK and EUPOL). Subsequently trainings are conducted in coordination with donors. Additionally, 648 prosecutors have been trained in prosecutors (STAAGE) courses.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
20	Detailed terms of reference for all prosecutors consistent with international treaties and best practices	20.1	AGO	Terms of reference for new prosecutors developed in compliance with the United Nations Guidelines on the Role of Prosecutors (1990) and Handbook on Practical Anti-Corruption Measures for Prosecutors and Investigators (2004) where practical	(15 Dec. 2013) - Prosecutors do not have TORs and still use Article 19 of the old law for their investigations.	(30 June 2015) - AGO has developed and finalized TORs for newly appointed prosecutors which are not in conflict with the United Nations Guidelines on the Role of Prosecutors (1990). Additionally, Article 28 of the Law on Structure and Authority of Prosecutors defines specific requirements for the recruitment of new prosecutors. E.g. the prosecutors should have at least a Bachelor degree in Law or Shariah Law, should be in full position of his Civil Rights, should not be member of a political party, should not be convicted of corruption, misdemeanor, or felony should not be addicted to drugs, should have completed the age of 24 and his STAAGE period.
		20.2	AGO	All current terms of reference evaluated and revised to ensure conformity with United Nations Guidelines on the Role of Prosecutors (1990) and Handbook on Practical Anti-Corruption Measures for Prosecutors and Investigators (2004) where practical	(15 Dec. 2013) - The TORs have not been revised yet. They are still using the old versions.	(30 June 2015) - AGO has developed and finalized TORs for prosecutors and administrative staff.
21	Statutory regulation of the use of brokers, including the identification and sanctioning of brokers that act illegally	21.1	MOF/ACD	Provisions included in the Customs Law for the preparation and maintenance of a blacklist of brokers who violate regulations	(15 Dec. 2013) - Provisions not included in the Customs Law.	(30 June 2015) - A new procedure for custom brokers was developed based on Articles 15 and 16 of the Customs Law, which was shared with MEC. This procedure includes requirements for obtaining a brokers license, conditions for the broker exam, broker obligations, obligations of the authorities towards brokers, dealing with the violations of law and regulations, training of brokers, annual evaluations and renewals of broker licenses, etc. Further, a monitoring unit has been established to control and monitor broker activities in order to systematically update the blacklist of brokers.
		21.2	MOF/ACD	Brokers who violate regulations are and blacklisted sufficiently penalized	(15 Dec. 2013) - Provisions not included in the Customs Law.	(30 June 2015) - The new Procedure for Customs Brokers include addressing violation of Laws and Regulations.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
22	Methods developed for the valuation of the type and quality of goods	22.1	MOF/ACD	ACD and relevant quality assurance entities including ANSA & MOPH develop and implement a policy for the verification of goods being imported	(15 Dec. 2013) - Methods exist but are not streamlined or coordinated, and are poorly implemented.	(31 Dec. 2015) - Based on Article 24 of the Customs Law, a new procedure for the use of the valuation module of the ASYCUDA system was developed and shared with MEC. The mention system is implemented in Kabul, Nangarhar, Kandhar, Herat and Aqina border. Additionally, ANSA has signed a 5-year contract with GeoChem (1391-1396) which includes the implementation of 6 fuel quality control labs in Afghan borders (Hairatan, Tor-Ghondi, Islam-Qala, Aqina, Farah and Nimrooz). A big part of the fuel is imported through the mentioned borders, the fuel imported through Sher-Khan border, is tested in Hairatan. ANSA also installed construction material quality control labs in Kabul, Herat and Nengrahar provinces. However, due to technical problems, e.g. lack of electricity and proper space, these labs are not active yet. The quality of food, cosmetics and pharmaceuticals is tested by MOPH, the quality of agricultural items is tested by MAIL.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
23	Tax exempted goods under the military technical agreement monitored and verified	23.1	MOF/ACD	Mechanism introduced for the verification of all goods being claimed under the MTA to ensure the agreement is not misused	(15 Dec. 2013) - ISAF is completely unwilling to consider any measure to verify goods being brought into Afghanistan.	(30 June 2015) - In regard to tax exempted goods the following documents exist: The Procedure of Exemption Control; The Guideline Form of Major Exemption; The Guideline of Export for the Goods of US armed forces; The Guideline of Export for ISAF goods; and The BSA. Article 16 of the newly approved BSA (Bilateral Security Agreement between Afghanistan and USA) stipulates: 16(4): The importation, exportation, re-exportation, transportation and use of any articles brought into Afghanistan pursuant to paragraphs 1 and 2 of this article shall not be subject to restrictions, such as licensing, inspection or verification, except as provided in this article. If Afghan authorities suspect the abuse of the privileges granted in paragraph 2 of this article to United States contractors and United States contractor employees, then relevant Afghan authorities reserve the right to inspect such personal effects when arriving or departing from civilian airports in Afghanistan or in personal vehicles at border crossings. 16(5): The relevant Afghan authorities reserve the right of verification of any container imported by United States contractors and United States contractor employees containing items for United States forces purposes in Afghanistan or for personal use, as authorized in paragraphs 1 and 2 of this article.
		23.2	MOF/ACD	Importers found to be making false claims under the MTA penalized and the goods in question seized	(15 Dec. 2013) - ISAF is completely unwilling to consider any measure to verify goods being brought into Afghanistan.	(30 June 2015) - According to Article 4 of the new General Guideline on Tax Exemption which was approved in May 2015 there are 8 categories of organizations including International Military Forces, NGOs, Embassies and Government Institutions which are exempted from tax. The implementation of this Guideline will reduce the opportunity of falsely declaring exempted goods. Two copies of Exemption Forms of US Embassy and WHO were shared with MEC. The new General Guideline of Tax Exemption Entering the Border was also shared with MEC.
24	Measures taken to estimate accurately revenue lost due to custom tax exemptions	24.1	MOF/ACD	Exemption forms not only kept in the archive, but also processed at the custom administration office	(10 Feb. 2015) – Exemption Forms are currently saved in archives and are not processed.	(30 June 2015) - The Exemption Unit sends the Exemption Forms after the approval of the MOF and MOEC to the relevant customs departments for processing. The forms are archived after the completion of the process. Two copies of processed Exemption Forms of US Embassy (without the price of goods) and WHO (with price of the goods) were shared with MEC.
		24.2	MOF/ACD	The price of goods put on all exemption forms	(10 Feb. 2015) - Most Exemption Forms of foreign military and political delegations do not include the price of goods.	(30 June 2015)- All Exemption Forms include the price of goods except the Forms that are used for the personal belongings of diplomats and used goods. Two copies of processed Exemption Forms of US Embassy and WHO were shared with MEC

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
25	Enhanced Minerals Law enacted to ensure transparency and competitive bidding, avoid conflicts of interest, enable community monitoring, secure sufficient royalties, and inclusive of anti-corruption provisions.	25.1	MOMP	Law restricts confidentiality of documents to withholding those that would truly undermine a company's competitiveness	(15 Dec. 2013) - Current definition of confidentiality much broader and includes documents not detrimental to competitiveness.	(30 June 2015) - An independent international audit group (The Marx Group) monitors the bidding process and prepares a report about the transparency of the process at the end of each bidding. The report is published on the website of the ministry. Further, all members of the Evaluation Committee are officially obligated not to reveal confidential information.
		25.2	MOMP	Contracts required to be published in full	(15 Dec. 2013) - Contracts are required to be published, but the draft law does not specify to what extent.	(30 June 2015) - The new Mining Law has been promulgated in the Official Gazette #1143 dated 25.05.1393. Based on Article 41 of the Mining Law, all contracts and documents related to mining should be publicly available, except those that have information that is explicitly considered as confidential by the law.
		25.3	MOMP	Restrictions on transfers of and changes to licenses and contracts expanded to ensure new owners are equally qualified to hold a transferred or altered license under the law	(15 Dec. 2013) - Article 26 of the draft law merely requires the transfer of new license holders to ensure contract continuity and legal conformity.	(30 June 2015) - Based on Article 29 of the Mining Law licensed contractors are not allowed to transfer their licenses to others unless official permission is explicitly granted by the MOMP in accordance with the conditions enshrined in the relevant regulations. Changes and amendments in the contract require an agreement of the parties.
		25.4	MOMP	Names of shareholders and administrators of license holders required to be published	(15 Dec. 2013) - Article 23 (6) of the draft law prevents the publication of ownership information without the written agreement of the parties.	(30 June 2015) - Names, addresses and shareholders of the company with their respective shares are included in the contract. (Article 67 of the Mining Law) Based on Article 23 of the Law, the contracts are published within 10 days after signing.
		25.5	MOMP	Decisions taken by the Inter-Ministerial Commission for mining declared null and void where undisclosed conflicts of interest are discovered	(15 Dec. 2013) - Conflicts of interest must be reported, but draft law does not include clause covering post-decision disclosure or discovery of conflict of interest.	(30 June 2015) - According to Article 10 (4) of the Law, if the personal interest of the member is affected, he/she is obligated to disclose the issue in advance. Otherwise the decision will not be valid.
		25.6	MOMP	Requirement for anti-corruption clauses in contracts and subcontracts signed with the Ministry of Mines and Petroleum included in the law	(15 Dec. 2013) - MOMP includes anti-corruption clauses in contracts and sub-contracts, but the practice is not required by the draft law.	(30 June 2015) - According to Article 99 of the Mining Law, every act of giving or receiving gifts (sherini, bakhshesh etc.) in order to obtain a permission, license or contract is considered corruption and will be prosecuted. Additionally, based on Article 100 of the Law, MOMP, MOF, licensed companies, contractors as well as other involved parties are obligated to adhere to AEITI rules to ensure transparency in the process.
		25.7	MOMP	Law requires the government to consult affected communities at the contracting stage	(15 Dec. 2013) - Communities only consulted after licenses have been issued and are not involved in monitoring activities.	(30 June 2015) - Based on articles 59 and 66 of the Mining Law, contractors are required to involve the community's needs and priorities and make efforts in the area's development.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
26	Comparative mining study conducted to identify international best practices that can be implemented in Afghanistan	26.1	MOMP	Study incorporates lessons from countries that have experienced conflict, under-exploited natural resources, and weak regulatory environments to identify best practices in contracting and oversight	(24 Feb. 2014) - Mining study completed and findings presented to MoMP; final version not distributed yet.	(30 June 2015) - Comprehensive research has been conducted by MOMP's experts and advisors to identify best international practices and methods. The findings have been used in drafting the Law and Regulations. Based on MEC's recommendations, IWA has conducted a comparative study of mining sector governance of seven developing countries in 2014.
27	Explicit contract provisions obliging partners and subcontractors to fully respect all applicable international and national anti-corruption standards	27.1	MOMP	All contracts include specific provision making contract null and void if anti-corruption laws and regulations violated	(15 Dec. 2013) - Anti-corruption provisions exist in contracts, but unclear if requirement included in law or regulations	(30 June 2015) - All contractors are obligated to obey all existing laws, including the Anti-Corruption Law. MEC Secretariat has reviewed two exemplary contracts (which include termination provisions in case of violation of Afghan Laws and Regulations
		27.2	MOMP	Specific anti-corruption standards outlined	(15 Dec. 2013) - Anti-corruption provisions exist in contracts, but unclear if requirement included in law or regulations	(30 June 2015) - The Mining Law includes special monitoring mechanisms regarding information sharing, field monitoring and international transparency criteria and standards for revenue collection. These mechanisms are detailed in the relevant regulation including the specific method of implementation.
28	Publication of all sub-contracts	28.1	MOMP	All contracting and subcontracting parties explicitly mentioned, profit and revenue sharing broken down for scrutiny, and scope of mining activities clearly laid out	(15 Dec. 2013) - Most contracts published, but do not include key details. Unclear to what extent subcontracts are also published.	(30 June 2015) - According to Article 23 (6) of the Mining Law the MOMP is obligated to publish all contracts and subcontracts within 10 days after their signing. The Ministry has published all contracts in a database on its website. The database contains 302 contracts. Only 82 contracts are active while the remaining contracts are expired, suspended or cancelled.
29	Higher levels of mining revenue reporting to capture a majority of mining revenue and mining companies in Afghanistan	29.1	MOMP	Reporting threshold captures majority of mining revenue	(15 Dec. 2013) - Threshold yet to be lowered.	(30 June 2015) - The current threshold for reporting purposes is 2.5 million Afs. The Secretariat of AEITI is planning to determine the thresholds in future in such a way to capture as much revenue as possible.
30	Anti-Money Laundering Law enacted according to international best practices	30.1	DAB	Revised law drafted in consultation with the IMF that meets FATF and Asia Pacific Group requirements for Afghanistan	(15 Dec. 2013) - The Afghan government - in cooperation with DAB - has been developing new legislation for several months. The draft law has yet to be sent to the National Assembly. MEC has conducted a review of the draft legislation and found that it generally meets international standards.	(30 June 2015) - The AML Law was amended based on FATF requirements and international best practices. The amended law was promulgated in the official gazette #1142.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
31	Policy on currency outflows at airports and borders developed and effectively implemented	31.1	DAB	ACD develops policy in close consultation with FINTRACA, MOI, DAB, NDS and the international community that requires the recording of the exportation of more than \$10,000 per person, including information on the source of the currency, and the reporting of the information to FINTRACA.		(31 Dec. 2015) - Based on Article 7 of the AML Law, FINTRACA has drafted the Regulation on the Transfer of Money, Securities and Marketable Instruments From Afghan Borders, in close cooperation with Customs Department of the MOF which was approved by the Council of Ministers in April 2015 and published in the official gazette No. 1170. However, registering the money outflow is effectively enforced on regular passengers but there is still concerns in the VIP section. MEC staff interviewed all relevant officials at the Kabul Airport who are involved in preventing money outflow including representatives of FINTRACA and visited the facilities at the Departure and Arrival Areas as well as the VIP Area. The Kabul airport is equipped with high-tech scanners (Rapiscan 628 XR) that can detect money, narcotics, antiques, etc. As a result, the ability to detect illegal money outflow has increased by 80% to 90% compared to previous years. The VIP Area is equipped with scanners, border police and immigration officers. All VIPs are registered and the list of VIP passengers is shared regularly with the border police and MOI. Passengers carrying cash exceeding the limit without knowledge of the limits are distributing the money among accompanying family members. In case of hiding the money to carry the money illegally out of Afghanistan, cases are referred to the AGO and the money is sent to DAB until a decision made by the judicial authorities.
		31.2	DAB	Sufficient specialized training in detection provided to airports and borders to effectively implement policy	(15 Dec. 2013) - The Afghan border police at Kabul International Airport have received training in anti-money laundering and smuggling techniques.	(30 June 2015) - Required trainings have been provided to customs officers, NDS, Border Police and airport staff.
32	Enhanced cooperation between FINTRACA and other government agencies	32.1	DAB	MOU signed between FINTRACA, Mol (Major Crimes Taskforce, Interpol), NDS, HOO, and DAB (Financial Supervision Department)	(15 Dec. 2013) - MOU prepared but waiting to be signed.	(30 June 2015) - FINTRACA has drafted the MOU on Information Sharing in consultation with the relevant stakeholders which has been signed by 11 stakeholders. A copy of the MOU has been shared with MEC. The MOU paved the way for further cooperation and as a result FINTRACA was able to respond to 76 inquiries of law enforcement agencies. Additionally, 20 cases of money laundering have been identified and referred to the AGO.
33	All previous and future decisions and meeting outcomes of the High Commission on Investment published	33.1	AISA	High Commission on Investment publishes all previous and future decisions including AISA performance reviews, budget approvals, work plans, financial reports, and audit results on AISA's website	(15 Dec. 2013) - Materials yet to be published.	(31 Dec. 2015) - AISA has published all of the resolutions and decisions of the High Commission of Investment on their website ( <a href="http://www.aisa.org.af">http://www.aisa.org.af</a> ).

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
34	Non-compliant NGOs are appropriately sanctioned for digressions	34.1	MOEc	NGOs given chance to address deficiencies, non-compliant NGOs penalized	(15 Dec. 2013) - NGOs have repeatedly been penalized for various transgressions.	(30 June 2015) - In case of violation or if a NGO fails to submit its report, the High Council of Evaluation orders corrective actions through an official letter. The correction period is 1 - 3 months. In case the NGO fails to take corrective actions, further decision will be made about its liquidation. Until now, 1.890 NGOs have been dissolved and the list has been shared with MEC.
35	Review plan is established and implemented with regular assessments	35.1	MOEc	M&E plan established and implemented	(15 Dec. 2013) - M&E plan yet to be established.	(30 June 2015) - The Directorate of NGOs has prepared the Monitoring and Site visit plan which is incorporated in the first 100 day plan of the Ministry. This plan includes the evaluation of 40 national and international NGOs. Based on the mentioned plan, 28 NGOs have been monitored and evaluated until 15.04.2015. MEC Secretariat has contacted two of the evaluated NGOs who confirmed the evaluation of MOEc. Besides continuing the evaluation based on the 100 day plan, MOEc plans to enhance the monitoring responsibilities of their provincial directorates.
36	A publicly available NGO database is created and regularly updated	36.1	MOEc	Database includes information on NGO mandate	(19 Mar. 2014) - Database does not include this information.	(30 June 2015) - The Homepage of the MOEc contains the lists of all NGOs including name, abbreviation, registration-number date and location, contact number and e-mail. Additionally, all NGOs are recorded in the online database for NGOs publicly available under <a href="http://www.ngos.moec.gov.af">www.ngos.moec.gov.af</a> .
		36.2	MOEc	Database information updated regularly	(19 Mar. 2014) - Unclear how often database updated.	(30 June 2015) - The online database of NGOs is updated regularly. The list of national and international NGOs is last updated on 24. February 2015.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
37	Evaluation of revenues and expenses of communication companies	37.1	MOCIT	MoCIT shares with MoF the audit reports of communication companies for the years 2008 - 2012	(6 May 2014) - Communications companies are reporting minimal amounts of revenue and profit in financial statements/tax document. This, contrasts with the audited financial statements being filed with ATRA.	(30 June 2015) - MOCIT has shared the audit reports of the telecommunication companies (Afghan Wireless, Roshan, MTN and Etisalat) for the years 2008 - 2012 with MEC. These audit reports have also been sent through an official letter (#518 and #519) to the Department of Revenue of the MoF and the Supreme Audit Office on 09.01.2014.
		37.2	MOF/MOCIT	MoF conducts a comparative analysis of the audit reports and the corresponding tax documents of all communication companies for the years 2008 - 2012.	(6 May 2014) - Communications companies are reporting minimal amounts of revenue and profit in financial statements/tax document. This, contrasts with the audited financial statements being filed with ATRA.	(31 Dec. 2015) - One of the main reasons which cause the difference between the tax statement and the audit report of the telecommunication companies is the difference between the Income Tax Law of Afghanistan which is applied for preparing the tax statement and the International Financial Reporting Standards which are used by foreign audit companies. MOF has conducted a comparative analysis of the telecommunication companies (Etisalat, Roshan, Afghan Telecom and MTN) for the years 2008 - 2012 and shared the report with MEC. The analysis indicates a general discrepancy between the income/expenses shown in the tax report and the audited financial reports of these companies. Only the tax and audit report of Afghan Telecom of 2012 do not show any discrepancy. MOF did not comment on the discrepancies.
38	An effective monitoring and evaluation system for Red Crescent programs developed and implemented	38.1	Afghan Red Crescent	The Afghanistan Red Crescent Society should implement a proper monitoring and evaluation system for all projects to determine whether programs and services are effectively reaching their intended beneficiaries.	(6 May 2014) - The Afghan Red Crescent Society has not implemented effective monitoring and evaluation systems to determine how well programs meet their objectives and serve end users.	(30 June 2015) - The Directorate of Audit and Monitoring of ARCS develops annual monitoring and evaluation plans for all projects, conducts monitoring of the projects on a quarterly basis and reports accordingly. On provincial level, the Natural Disasters Units are responsible for monitoring the projects and reporting to the headquarter. The annual financial statements and the ARCS's projects are audited by international auditors. Additionally, ARCS with the technical support of Norwegian Red Cross developed an anti-corruption policy in 2014 which has been approved by the Governance Board and is operational. A copy of the policy has been shared with MEC..

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
39	Development and adoption of an accounting procedure	39.1	Afghan Red Crescent	The Governance Board of the Afghanistan Red Crescent Society should adopt and operationalize a financial and accounting procedure and publish it on their official web site. The procedure should cover financial and accounting procedures, adequate recording of transactions, proper logging of moveable and immovable properties, internal control mechanisms, financial coding, and the preparation of financial statements	(6 May 2014) - Currently the Afghan Red Crescent does not have policies governing its financial accounting.	(30 June 2015) - The ARCS has developed an FINANCIAL MANUAL which was approved in June 2014 and is operational since then. The Manual is available on the website of ARCS in Dari and English. Additionally, the ARCS with the technical support of International Federation of Red Crescent has established a computerised financial system which includes modules for assets, liabilities, revenues, expenses and donations. The new system is operational in Kabul and 7 Zones. MEC Secretariat has visited the new system.
40	Clear and transparent terms and conditions for the procurement process and inventory management implemented	40.1	DABS	DABS develops and implements an annual procurement plan		(30 June 2015) - DABS has a procurement manual in place which is based on the Afghan Procurement Law. Additionally, all procurements of DABS are based on the annual procurement plan. MEC Secretariat has received a copy of the procurement plans of 1393 and 1394. DABS has signed 28 contracts in 1393. Additionally, 11 contracts were signed in 1393 with the financial assistance of USAID with a total contract value of \$281.5 million. Detailed information of all contracts have been shared with MEC.
		40.2	DABS	DABS develops transparent record-keeping procedures, especially related to procurement and storage of goods.		(30 June 2015) - DABS has an asset management policy in place which covers the recording of all inventories stock management and management of fixed assets.
		40.3	DABS	DABS develops stricter internal-control mechanisms and take accurate stock of its inventory		(31 Dec. 2015) - DABS manages its inventory and stock according to the asset management policy. Additionally, DABS has designed a new IT system with 12 modules, including an inventory management module with the support of USAID. The software has been designed and tested by DABS. A big part of the data has been entered into the new system which will go live in January 2016.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
41	Technical and managerial capacity building program established for the Ministry of Public Works to manage and oversee projects, including short-term and long-term expertise	41.1	MOPW	Program developed for the provision of technical assistance with the support of the international community to fill capacity gaps identified by the needs assessment with a particular focus on recruitment and training		(30 June 2015) - Based on the instruction of the new Minister, the HR Directorate of the Ministry has conducted a needs assessment to identify gaps for capacity building. The former leadership of the Ministry had taken the following measures based on the needs assessment conducted: 200 engineers of the Ministry have been trained in survey and design, M&E and project management (e.g. GIS, GPS, CIVIL 3D, AUTOCAD). The list of these engineers has been shared with MEC 15 engineers of the Ministry have been sent to Japan for 2 years to obtain their master degrees. Four have returned and were reintegrated in the Ministry. 15 employees have been trained on avalanche prevention in Italy. Some engineers received trainings on design and construction of roads and railways in China, Indonesia, Iran, Tajikistan and India.
42	Comprehensive corruption-reporting mechanism developed and implemented	42.1	MOPW	MOPW to establish a toll-free corruption hotline or similarly easily accessible mechanism for reporting cases of corruption	(15 Dec. 2013) - The MOPW is researching best practices with the help of MEC in order to establish the reporting mechanism.	(30 June 2015) - An anti-corruption unit has been established and a complaints box is installed at the ministry. Additionally, the phone number of the secretariat of the Minister has been made available to customers.
43	CoST initiative implemented in Afghanistan	43.1	MOEC	Develop terms of reference for CoST that cover membership, meetings, scope of activities, and criteria for reviewing projects		(31 Dec. 2015) - TOR and an implementation action plan have been developed for regulating the activities of CoST Secretariat and shared with MEC. CoST's meetings are held quarterly with the participation of all 13 members representing Government Institutions, Private Sector, the Parliament and Civil Society. The quarterly reports of CoST have been shared with MEC. The scope of CoST's work is available on its homepage <a href="http://www.constructiontransparency.org">www.constructiontransparency.org</a>

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
44	Technical and managerial capacity building program established for the Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development to manage and oversee projects, including short-term and long-term expertise	44.1	MRRD	Needs assessment conducted to identify gaps in capacity	(15 Dec. 2013) - Capacities at government ministries to manage and oversee projects is low.	(30 June 2015) - Based on the conducted needs assessment in MRRD, gaps have been identified in technical and managerial capacity of the. The MRRD has a M&E Directorate which is responsible to monitor and evaluate project results. During the lifecycle of the project, the monitoring is conducted by the respective program staff. MRRD has shared with MEC its M&E instrument.
		44.2	MRRD	Program developed for the provision of technical assistance with the support of the international community to fill capacity gaps identified by the needs assessment with a particular focus on recruitment and training		(30 June 2015) - To fill the identified gaps, MRRD has drafted and conducted short- and long-term capacity building programs in different areas. For example, short-term programs have been provided in M&E, power line design, Solar water pumping and operation and maintenance of equipment. Long-term capacity building have been provided for 122 employees in Afghanistan and abroad (UK, India, UAE, Thailand). The list of these employees have been shared with MEC.
45	Technical and managerial capacity building program established for the Ministry of Energy and Water to manage and oversee projects, including short-term and long-term expertise	45.1	MOEW	Needs assessment conducted to identify gaps in capacity	(15 Dec. 2013) - Capacities at government ministries to manage and oversee projects is low.	(30 June 2015) - Based on the needs assessment conducted by the MOEW, capacity gaps have been identified in internal audit, English language and computer skills of employees.
		45.2	MOEW	Program developed for the provision of technical assistance with the support of the international community to fill capacity gaps identified by the needs assessment with a particular focus on recruitment and training		(31 Dec. 2015) - MOEW has conducted capacity building programs in internal audit, computer skills and English language within the Ministry. Additionally, MOEW has provided short-term trainings to 393 employees in 1394, which included: Water management, Irrigation and Design, Hydroelectricity, Industrial Electricity, Solar Energy Production, Solar Technology, Gender Management and Law awareness. The ministry has also sent 5 employees to Japan to obtain their Master Degree. List of the training sessions has been shared with MEC.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
46	Technical and managerial capacity building program established for the Ministry of Urban Development Affairs to manage and oversee projects, including short-term and long-term expertise	46.1	MUDA	Needs assessment conducted to identify gaps in capacity		(30 June 2015) - MUDA has conducted a needs assessments and developed a capacity building program for 1394, based on the identified gaps. A Copy of the developed program has been shared with MEC
		46.2	MUDA	Program developed for the provision of technical assistance with the support of the international community to fill capacity gaps identified by the needs assessment with a particular focus on recruitment and training		(30 June 2015) - MUDA has developed several training programs to address the identified gaps which include: Computer Basics, Regional Survey Trainings, Electric Design Trainings, Water Supply Trainings, English Language trainings, Urban Management etc. The List of Participants has been shared with MEC. Additionally, 45 employees of the Ministry have been sent to Japan, India, Tajikistan and Iran, to obtain their Meister Degrees and 2 other employees have been sent to obtain their PhD from, 1390 to 1393. The list of these employees has been shared with MEC.
47	Technical and managerial capacity building program established for the Ministry of Mines and Petroleum to manage and oversee projects, including short-term and long-term expertise	47.1	MOMP	Needs assessment conducted to identify gaps in capacity		(31 Dec. 2015) - The HR department of MOMP has conducted a needs assessment with the assistance of ASI (Adam Smith International) and shared the report of its findings with MEC. Based on this assessment there is a capacity gap in technical expertise of this Ministry.
		47.2	MOMP	Program developed for the provision of technical assistance with the support of the international community to fill capacity gaps identified by the needs assessment with a particular focus on recruitment and training		(31 Dec. 2015) - MOMP has shared with MEC its capacity development report for the years 1390, 1391 and 1392. According to this report the Ministry has sent 33 employees to Japan, 1 to Germany, 10 to India 2 to Turkey for receiving their masters degree. Additionally, 350 Employees are sent to India, USA, China, South Africa, Poland, Pakistan, Iran, Finland, Turkey and Australia for short-term trainings. Additionally, 24 employees have been introduced to the Dunia University's "Graduate Management Training" and 20 female employees have been introduced to Mashal University's Bachelor Program with the support of GIZ.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
48	Technical and managerial capacity building program established for the municipalities to manage and oversee projects, including short-term and long-term expertise	48.1	Municipalities	Needs assessment conducted to identify gaps in capacity		(30 June 2015) - Kabul Municipality has conducted a comprehensive needs assessment in close cooperation with AIRCSC in the first quarter of 1393. A Copy of the needs assessment report has been shared with MEC.
		48.2	Municipalities	Program developed for the provision of technical assistance with the support of the international community to fill capacity gaps identified by the needs assessment with a particular focus on recruitment and training	(15 Dec. 2013) - Capacities at municipalities to manage and oversee projects is low.	(30 June 2015) - Based on the gaps identified in the needs assessment, Kabul Municipality in corporation with donors has provided several trainings including project management, financial management, PR, HR, policy & leadership, English and IT. Thee list of the participants hs been shared with MEC. Additionally, Kabul Municipality has sent 22 employees to Japan and India in 1390 - 1304 for obtaining their Master Degrees. A list of these employees have been shared with MEC.
49	Trainings and seminars for mullahs and madrasa teachers to sensitize them to acts of corruption and anti-corruption mechanisms	49.1	MOHRA	Develop a strategy to identify training targets for mullahs and madrasa teachers	(15 Dec. 2013) - No strategy developed for mullahs but the line ministries are working on developing this project.	(30 June 2015) - The MOHRA has established a training Centre (Tadribul Umah) in Kabul to provide training for mullahs on how to raise public awareness from an Islamic perspective. Mullahs are instructed by MOHRA on a weekly basis to cover specific topics at the Friday prayers including anti-corruption themes. MEC staff verified this during a Friday prayer, where the mullah discussed about different types of corruption including bribery and embezzlement from an Islamic perspective.
		49.2	MOHRA	Develop a training module for delivering anti-corruption concepts to mullahs and madrasa teachers outlined in the targets	(15 Dec. 2013) - No training modules developed for mullahs but the line ministries are working on developing this project.	(30 June 2015) - MOHRA has established a training centre (Tadribul Umah) in Kabul to provide training for mullahs on how to raise public awareness from an Islamic perspective. Mullahs are instructed by MOHRA on a weekly basis to cover specific topics at the Friday prayers including anti-corruption themes.
		49.3	MOHRA	Deliver training to a majority of mullahs and madrasa teachers within one year of developing the training module	(15 Dec. 2013) - No seminars conducted for mullahs or madrasa teachers but the line ministries are working on developing this project.	(30 June 2015) - IWA initiated a project (Towards Transparency) in cooperation with MOHRA funded by HARAKAT to raise public awareness and enhance transparency. The project includes the establishment of a website (Ifshagar) and a hotline (0786106106), the publication of a book on the fight against corruption from an Islamic perspective and conducting training sessions for mullahs in 9 zones of the country.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
50	Anti-corruption information disseminated to people through mosques and religious scholars	50.1	MOHRA	MOHRA periodically provides a circular on anti-corruption teachings and requests mullahs to preach on anti-corruption issues	(15 Dec. 2013) - No circular provided by the ministry so far but mullahs have preached about anti-corruption in the mosques.	(30 June 2015) - Based on MOHRA's official instructions to the mosques and mullahs, different topics including corruption from an Islamic perspective are discussed during the Friday prayers.
		50.2	MOHRA	MOHRA develops and distributes anti-corruption materials for mosques	(15 Dec. 2013) - Some materials, such as brochures, have been distributed in mosques by the ministry.	(30 June 2015) - MOHRA in corporation with IWA has drafted and issued some booklets and a book which covers anti-corruption issues from an Islamic perspective. The project was funded by Harakat.
51	Media campaign strategy developed and implemented	51.1	HOO	HOO develops and implements a public campaign on anti-corruption, including TV programs, radio shows, and billboards	(15 Dec. 2013) - HOO has developed different media campaigns through national TV, short clips and billboards. These campaigns are not conducted regularly due to not having enough funds.	(30 June 2015) - Although HOO has not responded to MEC's official letters, MEC is aware of the anti-corruption campaigns launched by HOO through TV clips, radio, and billboards.
		51.2	MOIC/RTA	National television channels support anti-corruption efforts by providing air-time for regular anti-corruption related programs, such as MOCIT public service announcements	(15 Dec. 2013) - There is no anti-corruption program on national TV now, only some irregular interviews in the Good Morning Program.	(31 Dec. 2015) - National Radio and TV broadcast some anti-corruption related programs including speeches of religious scholars, interviews with relevant officials and anti-corruption messages. Previously, the National Radio TV had an anti-corruption program called Shafafyat (Transparency), which was funded by HOO. But this program is not broadcasted anymore. Based on the report of National Radio and TV, 3 roundtables, 4 reports and 1 drama have been broadcasted on anti-corruption issues since last 3 months and will be continued in future.
52	Government publications used to disseminate anti-corruption information	52.1	MOIC	Government newspapers, gazettes, and magazines (such as Anis, Hewad and Kabul Times) regularly inform public of cases of corruption and anti-corruption efforts	(15 Dec. 2013) - As far as MEC is informed, no anti-corruption information is published in newspapers and magazines regularly.	(30 June 2015) - Government newspapers usually cover anti-corruption related issues. MEC Secretariat has received some examples of the anti-corruption articles in government newspapers. In case anti-corruption entities (HOO, MEC) would like to publicize any specific anti-corruption topics, MOIC is willing to support this.
		52.2	MOIC	Government newspapers, gazettes and magazines include anti-corruption public service messages and information on reporting mechanisms		(30 June 2015) - Government newspapers usually cover anti-corruption related issues. MEC Secretariat has received some examples of the anti-corruption articles in government newspapers. In case anti-corruption entities (HOO, MEC) would like to publicize any specific anti-corruption topics, MOIC is willing to support this.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
53	Procurement Law amended to ensure consistency with international best practices and government-wide effective implementation	53.1	National Procurement Authority	Law ensures provisions included in public contracts explicitly limiting sub-contracting share	(15 Dec. 2013) - Article 54 of the draft Procurement Law includes provisions that would restrict subcontracting to 20 percent of the total value of the contract.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The Procurement Law has been reviewed and amended by the National Procurement Authority. The law has been endorsed through PD # 75 dated 02.Sep. 2015 and promulgated in the Official Gazette # 1186 on 07.Oct. 2015. According to Article 36 of the new Procurement Law, a contractor can subcontract a part of the original contract under the following conditions: 1) The subcontracting has been enshrined in the Standard Bidding Document (SBD) and specified in the original contract. 2) Official written agreement of the relevant institution has been obtained 3) The sub-contract is not in contradiction to the original contract. Additionally, according to Article 36 (3) of this law, the conditions and limits of sub-contracting will be regulated in the Procurement Procedure. According to Article 101 of the Procurement Procedure, a contractor can subcontract up to 20% of the original contract amount, provided that provisions of Article 36 of the Procurement Law are met.
		53.2	National Procurement Authority	Law ensures that information about contractors and subcontractors made publicly available		(31 Dec. 2015) - According to Article 42, 46 and 52 of the new Procurement Law, procurement entities are obligated to publish their contracts, including all contract details, on their homepage and other websites recommended by the National Procurement Authority. Additionally, the procuring entities are obliged to register their contracts with the National Procurement Authority.
54	Enhanced awareness of the Appeal and Review Committee amongst domestic and foreign bidders	54.1	National Procurement Authority	Establish discreet committee website	(15 Dec. 2013) - There have been no substantive efforts to raise awareness of bidders of the PPU.	(30 June 2015) - The Appeal and Review Committee is incorporated in the PPU's website.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
55	All government institutions with procurement functions staffed with dedicated procurement specialists	55.1	National Procurement Authority	Establish clear terms of reference and responsibilities for procurement specialists with sufficient oversight role that separates their functions (i.e. need identification, contracting, and payment oversight) to provide checks and balances for the procurement activities of relevant government institutions	(15 Dec. 2013) - The PPU has representatives in all ministries to support the procurement process and to train procurement personnel. The PPU has also created a new department of capacity building and over 5,000 employees from various governmental institutions have been trained so far. There continues to be a lack of a clear separation between those responsible for deciding on new contracts and those responsible for overseeing these contracts.	(30 June 2015) - Procurement specialists have been appointed in all ministries by the MOF.
		55.2	National Procurement Authority	MOF provides regular technical training to dedicated procurement specialists	(15 Dec. 2013) - The PPU has representatives in all ministries to support the procurement process and to train procurement personnel. The PPU has also created a new department of capacity building and over 5,000 employees from various governmental institutions have been trained so far.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The National Procurement Authority has designed and conducted procurement trainings on a basic-, mid-, and high-level. In addition to the procuring entities, private sector employees can also participate in these trainings. The related documents and list of the participants are available on the website of the NPA. According to the announced lists, more than 5000 employees of procuring entities have been trained so far.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
56	Institutions are identified, prioritized and audited based on risk factors	56.1	SAO	Detailed and in-depth financial and performance audit conducted of ARDS	(15 Dec. 2013) - Financial and performance audit not conducted due to lack of SAO personnel.	(31 Dec. 2015) - SAO included the audit of ARDS in its annual plan for the year 1394 (second quarter) which is completed. However, ARDS has been merged with other procurement bodies to the National Procurement Agency based on Presidential Order Nr. 16 dated 12.10.2014.
		56.2	SAO	Detailed and in-depth financial and performance audit conducted of MORR, including the potential misuse of funds for facilities, secondary accounts, salary administration, and the construction of shelters	(15 Dec. 2013) - The audit was completed but the complete report has not been shared with MEC so far.	(30 June 2015) - SAO shared the audit report of MORR with MEC. According to the report, the misuse of funds through fake documentation totaled 695,148 Afghanis. The SAO has officially referred the case to the AGO for prosecution on 04.07.1392.
		56.3	SAO	Detailed and in-depth financial and performance audit conducted of CTAP, including personnel embedded in different ministries and institutions	(15 Dec. 2013) - Financial and performance audit not conducted due to lack of SAO personnel.	(30 June 2015) - Based on MEC's recommendations, SAO included the audit of CTAP in a special audit plan. The audit has been completed and the report shared with MEC which reveals the violation of several laws: E.g. the violation of the Civil Servants Law in the recruitment process, receiving salaries from different sources and the violation of the Income Tax Law in regard to taxes on salaries. Additionally, hiring relatives and family members of high ranking government officials are mentioned in the report with specific examples and names.
		56.4	SAO	Detailed and in-depth financial and performance audit conducted of AISA, including governance and oversight mechanisms	(24 Mar. 2014) - AISA audit is in progress, but not completed yet.	(30 June 2015) - The audit period of AISA started on 16.11.1392 and was completed on 31.01.1393 and covered the years 1390 - 1392. SAO issued 19 specific recommendations to AISA and shared a copy of the audit report with MEC. The audit report shows that AISA's annual revenue of approximately \$8 million was not submitted to the government budget since the establishment of AISA. According to Article 42 of the Constitution, <b>"every kind of tax, duty, as well as paid incomes shall be deposited to a single state account."</b>
		56.5	SAO	SAO conducts a comprehensive audit of DABS covering the periods 2009-2014		(30 June 2015) - SAO audits DABS every year. DABS has shared the audit reports of 1389 - 1392 with MEC. The audit of 1393 is not completed yet and will be shared with MEC when completed.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
57	All permanent and temporary election staff are vetted	57.1	IEC	Mechanisms developed and implemented by IEC to identify all election staff who participated in illicit activities in past elections	(15 Dec. 2013) - IEC has developed a database that contains the main information of all former employees and contractors of IEC who were involved in illicit activities in the past election. The data were used to ensure that IEC staff who were involved in illicit activities in the past election are not recruited again.	(30. June 2015) - IEC decided on 10.09.2014 to refer 2,121 employees from the first round of the presidential election and 3,709 employees from the second round of the election, who were involved in fraudulent and illegal activities, to the IECC. Additionally, the IECC identified 10,000 temporary employees and some 20 permanent employees of the Election Commissions who were involved in electoral fraud. MEC Secretariat has sent an official letter to IECC requesting updated information on the prosecution of the employees involved in electoral fraud but has not received any response yet.
		57.2	IEC	All applicants (temporary, permanent, and/or voluntary) vetted against list of individuals who allegedly participated in illicit activities in past elections	(15 Dec. 2013) - IEC has developed a database that contains the main information of all former employees and contractors of IEC who were involved in illicit activities in the past election. The data were used to ensure that IEC staff who were involved in illicit activities in the past election are not recruited again.	(30 June 2015) - Employees and contractors of IEC who were involved in illicit activities in the past elections are registered in the database which will ensure that those employees will not be recruited again.
58	Effective polling staff training plan created and implemented	58.1	IEC	Training plan developed and implemented that includes direct training by IEC for all district level polling staff	(15 Dec. 2013) - The key staff members of the polling stations are going to be trained directly by the field coordinators at the district level while the supporting staff of the polling stations are going to be trained in each polling station. To ensure that the election staff properly understand the election procedures and have enough time allocated for practical work, particularly for the appropriate use of election forms, an extra day was added to all trainings compared with previous elections.	(31 Dec. 2015) - IEC has developed a guideline for training of trainers and shared a copy of the guideline with MEC. The IEC implemented a training program through the Directorate of Training and Capacity Building. 188 Trainers from 34 provinces have been trained during a 6-day training-session in Kabul regarding voting procedures and the counting of votes. These 188 trainers provided a 6-day training-session for 3,000 local field coordinators in their respective provinces. These 3,000 local field-coordinators provided a 5-day training session to 108,188 polling station staff, including registration employees, controllers and voting centre managers.
		58.2	IEC	Monitoring unit established within the IEC and a monitoring plan created and implemented to observe trainings and conduct spot checks	(15 Dec. 2013) - Effective monitoring plan prepared and implemented by the IEC. Apart from the monitoring of the trainings by field coordinators, the IEC established a monitoring unit at IEC's HQ which is responsible for the monitoring of IEC's training programs. Moreover, the IEC will request civil society and the Human Rights Commission to observe the training process.	(30 June 2015) - To ensure the effectiveness of the trainings, the IEC has monitored the training sessions in all stages mentioned above. Additionally, CSOs, the Human Rights Commission and UNAMA observed and monitored the training sessions.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
59	Campaign commitments to anti-corruption are met	59.1	MEC	Candidates make anti-corruption pledges	(20 Apr. 2014) - 2014 presidential candidates largely included anti-corruption issues in their campaigns.	(30 June 2015) - The leading presidential candidates (Ashraf Ghani and Dr. Abdullah) had largely included anti-corruption issues in their campaigns and dedicated high priority to the fight against corruption.
60	Recruitment and appointment processes implemented based on merit, fairness and transparency	60.1	IARCSC	IARCSC assesses staffing procedures in all institutions to check conformity with recruiting principles	(15 Dec. 2013) - IARCSC reform plan under review by OAA.	(30 June 2015) - IARCSC has evaluated the recruitment procedures of government institutions and as a result amended the recruitment procedure in accordance with the Civil Servants Law. A copy of the new procedure has been shared with MEC.
		60.2	IARCSC	IARCSC develops mechanism to conduct audits of staffing procedures in public institutions that includes an investigation of relationships of appointed officials	(15 Dec. 2013) - IARCSC reform plan under review by OAA.	(30 June 2015) - In order to oversee the recruitment process in public entities and ensure transparency, the recruitment and appointment board of IARCSC regularly assigns its HR specialists to attend all job interviews. Additionally, the complaints board of the CSC invigilates all officially registered cases.
61	Civil servant misconduct assessed appropriately and available disciplinary measures put to use	61.1	IARCSC	IARCSC conducts awareness campaign among civil servants to highlight existence of IARCSC Complaints Board		(30 June 2015) - The IARCSC Complaints Board has conducted awareness workshops for civil servants in Kabul and provinces to inform them about its activities, goals and approaches. As an example members of Complaints Board has conducted a workshop in Herat province on Oct. 20 2014 and shared the related documents with MEC. Additionally, the IRACSC has shared their plan for 1394 with MEC which includes trainings for 3 Zones: East, West and North Zones.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
62	Qualified commissioners appointed in IARCSC.	62.1	IARCSC	Review and amend the Administrative Reform and the Civil Service Law	(30 Oct. 2013) - The Civil Service Law is not sufficiently transparent and lacks a mechanism to ensure openness in the hiring process of the Commissioners.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The appointment of IARCSC Commissioners is based on the requirements of Article 8 of Civil Service Law. Additionally, some provisions of the Civil Service Law has been amended through the Presidential Legislative Decree # 82, dated 06. Sep. 2015. A copy of the Legislative Decree along with the amendments of the law has been shared with MEC.
		62.2	IARCSC	The service period of the commissioners not extended more than two years, educational degree of the commissioners should be at least a masters, and a minimum of 5 years of managerial experience and 5 years of experience in the relevant field	(30 Oct. 2013) - Hiring people without considering their former experience or relevant fields of expertise can expose the process to corruption	(30 June 2015) - The appointment of IARCSC Commissioners is based on the requirements of Article 8 of Civil Servants Law. The new TOR for Commissioners, which have been developed in 1393, require a minimum educational degree of a masters and 8 years of experience at a high level of the civil service. According to the IARCSC, all current commissioners are appointed by the former President and have required education and work experience.
		62.3	IARCSC	The IARCSC reviews its organizational structure and removes some of the directorates from its structure that create overlap between the main departments of the Commission and integrates them in similar directorates	(30 Oct. 2013) - The existence of many entities reporting to the Chairman of the Commission and many departments of the Administrative Reforms Commission being involved in the recruitment process has caused much confusion and inefficiencies in the process.	(30 June 2015) - The IARCSC has established a Committee in 1393 to review and reform the organizational structure of the IARCSC. The Committee has reviewed the organizational structure, terms of reference and load of work and drafted a new organizational structure based on the strategic goals of the Commission. The new organisational structure was approved by the OAA and is applicable since April 2015. As an example, the Directorate of HRMIS was merged with the Directorate of Support and Alignment of HR. Since the above mentioned document is confidential, the CSC denied to share it with MEC.
63	Individuals who violate the legal provision of the recruitment process identified and handed over to the appropriate authorities.	63.1	IARCSC	IARCSC must identify individuals who violate the legal documents of the recruitment process and refer cases to the relevant authorities.	(30 Oct. 2013) - Although the legal framework of the process has penalties for violations they are not often implemented.	(31 Dec. 2015) - IARCSC has identified several violations in the appointment process through the General Directorate of Civil Services and referred them to the Special Representative of the President for Reform and Good Governance as well as to AOP. This is an ongoing process IARCSC has identified 87 violation in the recruitment process during the fiscal year 1394 which include: Recruitment without the required work experience, recruitment without the required academic degree, recruitment without the minimum score, and recruitment out of competitive process. The detailed list of the above violations have been shared with MEC.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
64	List of Commissioners whose service period extended more than once prepared and submitted it to the President of Afghanistan	64.1	IARCSC	The Chairman of the IARCSC should prepare a list of the Commissioners whose service period has been extended more than once and submit it to the President of Afghanistan to appoint new individuals.	(6 Mai 2014) - The lack of a limit on extensions of the Commissioners' service period is a corruption vulnerability.	(31 Dec. 2015) - According to IARCSC's report, the appointment and renewal of service period of the commissioners is not the responsibility of the appointment board because the Commissioners positions are political and out of grade. IARCSC sent the list of all 7 commissioners along with the proposal # 16, dated 29. May 2014 to the Presidential Office for extension or termination of their services period, in accordance with Article 5 (3). The former President has approved the extension period of their services through PD 2368, dated 25. June 2014.
65	Priority government processes identified for simplification	65.1	IARCSC	Key government processes identified and prioritized for simplification	(15 Dec. 2013) - 356 administrative procedures in six ministries have been simplified, and 50 more are set to be simplified in 2014.	(30 June 2015) - The IARCSC identified 25 procedures for simplification in the fourth quarter of 1393. Nine of the identified processes in three different ministries (MOLSAMD, MOPH, and MOCIT) have been simplified. Additionally, nine procedures in 3 different institutions are identified and prioritised for simplification in 1394. E.g. the procedure of distribution of residential land, procedure of transformation of ownership titles, procedure for collecting cleaning fees of Kabul Municipality and procedure for establishing medicine factories in the provinces and the procedures for transferring pharmacies and pharmacy licenses at the MOPH.
		65.2	IARCSC	Simplification of procedures prioritized for building permits, pensions, land distribution for repatriates, identity cards, driver's licenses, examination and graduation certificates, and addressing public complaints, particularly with regards to escalating complaints to the attention of a relevant minister	(15 Dec. 2013) - Steps for obtaining residential and commercial building permits as well as for the distribution of commercial land have been reduced, but implementation remains slow. The Pension Department of MOLSAMD has automated some procedures through a World Bank-funded project to reform the pension application and payment procedures. Distribution of land to returnees is hampered by bureaucracy and illegal interference, including bribery and land usurpation. 50 administrative procedures are set to be simplified in 2014, including those for obtaining a driver's license. Obtaining a graduation certificate from the MOHE has been simplified and should take two to three days, but in practice it takes much longer.	(31 Dec. 2015) - Some procedures are already simplified: E.g. the procedure of pension, driving license and certificate issuance are simplified. The Identity Card issue is delayed due to political concerns. Regarding public complaints, there are two simple and clear approaches: First the Complaint Box in every ministry and secondly, everyone can submit a written complaint directly to the Minister Office. Additionally, IARCSC has shared with MEC the summary of the simplification report of 1394. According to this report 9 procedures have been simplified in 3 institutions (Kabul Municipality, MUDA and MOPH) and implementation agreements have been signed with these institutions. Additionally, MOUs have been signed with the mentioned institutions for simplifying 9 other procedures.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
66	Administrative processes simplified based on prioritization	66.1	IARCSC	Map administrative processes to identify unnecessary procedures and points of contact that offer vulnerabilities to corruption	(15 Dec. 2013) - 356 administrative procedures in six ministries have been simplified, and 50 more are set to be simplified in 2014.	(30 June 2015) - Flowcharts are prepared for procedures that are prioritized for simplification. The flowcharts for some of the simplified processes are prepared and were physically observed by MEC staff at the IARCSC.
		66.2	IARCSC	Design new processes in close consultation with affected institutions that eliminate the identified deficiencies and utilize modern technology to the greatest extent possible		(30 June 2015) - New processes are being designed in close cooperation between the IARCSC and relevant ministries, under the leadership of the ministries.
67	Enhanced understanding and awareness of new procedures amongst civil servants	67.1	IARCSC	Develop written practices and procedures and distribute them among civil servants	(15 Dec. 2013) - The IARCSC has developed an "Administrative Procedures Simplification Manual" and shared a copy with MEC that includes detailed steps on how to simplify an administrative process and the use of needs assessments. It is unclear whether these measures are specific enough to highlight new procedures.	(30 June 2015) - New procedures are prepared in writing and made available to the relevant institutions. MEC's Secretariat has seen and verified the existence of some of the procedures. Hard copies of some of the simplified procedures have been shared with MEC.
		67.2	IARCSC	Training for civil servants conducted	(15 Dec. 2013) - The IARCSC has reported that it has a plan for providing training on new procedures to the employees involved in providing services to the people and will share the new procedures with relevant institutions.	(30 June 2015) - Training sessions for relevant employees are conducted at the beginning of the simplification process as well as after the implementation. MEC has received lists of participants of the training programmes.
68	Awareness of new administrative procedures raised among end users	68.1	IARCSC	Simplified procedures depicted in easily understandable manner	(15 Dec. 2013) - To date, all legislation has been published on the MOJ website or in the Official Gazette (Jarida Rasmi). The Directorate of Publication (Nasharat) prints 2,000 – 5,000 copies of new legislation based on the need and importance of the legislation. They send these publications to all public institutions throughout the country through the MOCIT as well as private companies.	(30 June 2015) - MEC Secretariat has seen some of the flowcharts of the simplified procedures e.g. the procedure of Pension, Graduation Certificate etc. which were easily understandable.
69	Lunch hours must be strictly enforced. Any personal issues, including family emergencies, medical treatment, Fateha (Mourning) should be addressed through the use of legally entitled leave days or on weekends/holidays.	69.1	MOLSAMD	OAA sends a circular to all government institutions and in cooperation with IARCSC and MoHRA develops and implements a transparent mechanism in order to prevent misuse of official time	(15 Nov. 2014) - Public servants are regularly leaving their offices pretending to attend funeral ceremonies.	(31 Dec. 2015) - In order to prevent misuse of official hours and assure discipline, MOLSAMD has developed a Laiha in 1393, called the Internal Discipline Guideline. The third chapter of this Laiha is regulating official hours and chapter 5 is covering work discipline including attendance and absence of public employees. The mentioned Laiha has been distributed to all government institution and shared with MEC.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
70	Implementation of new procedures monitored and evaluated for effectiveness	70.1	IARCSC	Develop audit mechanism to monitor implementation of new procedures	(15 Dec. 2013) - Disciplinary measures yet to be developed or enforced.	(30 June 2015) - There is a regular monitoring mechanism in place which includes the following steps: Is there a guideline for the simplified procedure? Is the simplified procedure being implemented? Are the employees aware of the new Procedure? Is the flowchart of the new procedure properly exhibited on the wall of the implementing institution? Are there any obstacles from the institutions/employees towards the new procedure? Is the new procedure less time consuming than the previous one? Are the responsibilities of each unit clearly defined? Are the applicants happy with the new procedure? Are there any external constraints? Is the simplified procedure effective in the implementation of the overall plan of the ministry? Is the service provision of the ministry improved? Are there enough resources? A copy of the monitoring form which includes the final opinion of the IARCSC was shared with MEC.
71	Compulsory ethical modules provided for Civil Servants	71.1	IARCSC	The Civil Service Institute includes compulsory modules on ethics and customer service for all Civil Servants.		(30 June 2015) - The Civil Service Institute provides trainings on civil service related laws and regulations including compulsory trainings on Civil Servants Code of Conduct for all civil servants.
72	Provincial Budgeting Policy developed	72.1	MOF	Provincial Budgeting Policy drafted by MOF with close cooperation of MOEC and IDLG that incorporates an explicit role for PDCs in the prioritization of budget items	(01 Feb. 2014) - Provincial Budgeting Policy developed by the MOF with close cooperation of MOEC and IDLG and after consultation with MEC, the comments of MEC were included in the policy.	(30 June 2015) - The revised draft Provincial Budgeting Policy has been drafted by MOF in close cooperation with MOEC and IDLG which guarantees a clear role for the Provincial Development Councils. A copy of the revised policy has been shared with MEC.
		72.2	MOF	Cross-reporting oversight mechanism developed that requires the MOF to report on the rates of budget execution to the provinces and the provinces to provide the MOF with assessments of the budget execution.		(30 June 2015) - Oversight and reporting mechanism is part of the draft Provincial Budgeting Policy. A copy of the revised policy has been shared with MEC.
		72.3	MOF	Provincial Budgeting Policy approved by the Council of Ministers	(19 Mar. 2014) - The policy has not been approved by the Council of Ministers yet	(31 Dec. 2015) - The Provincial Budgeting Policy was approved by the Council of Ministers on 13.07.1394 (05. Oct. 2015). A copy of the revised policy had been shared with MEC in advance.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
73	Strengthened capacity of provincial development committees to actively participate in the budgeting process and oversight	73.1	MOF	MOF and IDLG deliver annual budgeting process trainings in the lead up to the budgeting process for the provincial partners identified in the Provincial Budgeting Policy	(15 Dec. 2013) - According to the MOF, they have continuously provided required trainings for provinces on the budgeting process and according to the Budget Directorate of the MOFA, the PDCs do have the capacity to fulfil their responsibilities in this regard.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The MOF has been conducting capacity building trainings in public financial management for all provincial entities since 1386. The training sessions are still on-going. Additionally, capacity building programs are currently under process, which includes i.a. modules on: general Information on budgeting, role of the provinces in the budgeting process, general information on budget execution, M&E etc. Additionally, MOF has conducted 4 capacity building programs on budgeting in 1393 in Panjshir, Badakhshan, Sar-Pul and Jozjan provinces which has been supported and coordinated by IDLG / ASGP.
74	Necessary changes to Articles 2, 4 and 8 of Procedure of Higher Education for distribution of diplomas made and simplified	74.1	MOHE	Ministry of Higher Education in consultation with universities revises and approves necessary changes in the diploma distribution procedure	(30 Sep. 2013) - Articles 2, 4 and 8 of the Procedure of Higher Education for the distribution of diplomas pave the way for corruption and delay the process. (e.g. Paragraph 3 of Article 2 states: "To provide facilities for graduates who are applying for higher education." This creates barriers for students who just want to have their diploma and are not interested in higher education.	(30 June 2015) - The Procedure of Higher Education for distribution of diplomas has been simplified, approved and sent to universities for implementation.
75	Approved procedure of distribution of diplomas by MOHE	75.1	MOHE	MOHE in consultation with the universities operationalizes a mechanism aimed at the effective implementation of this procedure	(30 Sep. 2013) - Shortfalls in the implementation mechanism of the legal documents make the process vulnerable to corruption	(30 June 2015) - The Procedure for Distribution of Diplomas has been simplified and approved by MOHE. The MOHE provided blank diplomas to all government universities based on the list of graduates from universities. Additionally, the process of diploma distribution for graduates of private universities has started. MOHE sends the soft-copy of the diploma designed specifically for private universities to the relevant universities. The universities fill in the soft version and sends it back to the MOHE for issuing the hard copy. MEC has received a copy of a blank diploma designed for private university graduates.
76	A proportionate administrative structure for universities created	76.1	MOHE	MOHE in coordination with IARCSC creates a proportionate administrative structure for universities	(30 Sep. 2013) - A small organizational structure and inadequate salaries are damaging to the process. Organizational structures of all universities are at the same level while they are different in terms of students and teachers.	(30 June 2015) - The organizational structure of universities and academic institutions are proportionate to their needs and scope of activities. E.g. Kabul University has more faculties, departments, teachers and administrative staff than the University of Bamyan, Paktia, Kapisa etc.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
77	TOR for universities revised.	77.1	MOHE	Terms of reference for universities revised	(30 Sep. 2013) - The terms of reference for the staff are new and applicable, but there are three problematic issues: The amount of work is beyond the ability of the position and causes work slowdowns for the customers; terms of reference are incomprehensive and do not list duties properly; and occasionally there is work interference between the Teaching and Students' Affairs Directorates.	(30 June 2015) - The TORs for the universities have been renewed. MEC has received some new and old TORs of the administrative employees for comparison. The new TORs for the same position requires higher education and more work experience. Additionally, some minor amendments were made in the TORs.
78	Administrative posts separated from academic positions	78.1	MOHE	MOHE, in coordination with IARCSC, develops a procedure to separate administrative positions from academic positions.	(30 Sep. 2013) - Currently there are overlapping TORs for administrative and academic positions.	(30 June 2015) - Academic and administrative positions are separated. There are 5,786 academic positions at the MOHE. The positions of Chancellors and Deans of the universities are academic positions following the recommendations of IARCSC.
79	Built capacity of employees on diploma issuance process	79.1	MOHE	MOHE provides training to relevant university employees on the process of issuing diplomas	(30 Sep. 2013) - The capacity of staff is better than in other civil service entities. Nevertheless, some problems have been noticed due to low capacity. There is a need for English language training as well as management skills, planning, and care of customers.	(30 June 2015) - The MOHE has reportedly provided short term on-job trainings to the employees involved in the process of diplomas issuance.
80	Trainings on management, ethics, English language and computer skills provided.	80.1	MOHE	MOHE provide trainings to the relevant employees on management, ethics, English language and computer skills	(30 Sep. 2013) - The capacity of staff is better than in other civil service entities. Nevertheless, some problems have been noticed due to low capacity. There is a need for English language training as well as management skills, planning, and care of customers.	(30 June 2015) - The MOHE has provided short term courses to enhance the skills of its employees in different areas including English language, Code of Conduct and Management and computer skills. MOHE has shared the list of participants with MEC. The Secretariat has contacted some of the participants and verified their participation.
81	A fair and transparent mechanism to distribute benefits set and approved by MOHE.	81.1	MOHE	Authorities in the universities set a fair and transparent mechanism to distribute benefits and approve it by MOHE.	(30 Sep 2013) The academic staff enjoy the whole benefits and there is less chance of promotion in administrative sections in the universities.	(31 Dec. 2015) - Academic and administrative positions are separated and each position is either academic or administrative with the related salary and benefits. According to Article 35 of the Higher Education Law, salaries of the academic cadres should be regulated in a separated regulation. Administrative positions' salaries on the other hand, are regulated in based on Article 70 of this Law in accordance with the Labour Law and the Civil Servants Law

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
82	Establish one stop window approach	82.1	MOHE	MOHE establishes one stop window approach to effectively collect all applications from clients	(30 Sep. 2014) - The accumulation of applications also gives rise to work pressure and disorder and sometimes results in conflict between visitors and staff. Direct contact with visitors causes chaos and nervousness.	(30 June 2015) - The MOHE has established a one stop-shop for providing services to its customers. The established unit is comprised of representatives of all relevant directorates where they receive applications and documents and provide the required services. The establishment of this unit has facilitated the process and reduced unnecessary waiting times. MEC staff have visited the unit and interviewed some applicants from different provinces. The customers are apparently satisfied with the new approach.
83	Blank diplomas made widely available within all government universities	83.1	MOHE	Blank diplomas made available within all government universities in the centre and provinces	(30 Sep. 2013) - Universities face shortages of blank diplomas, especially diplomas in English.	(30 June 2015) - The MOHE provided blank diplomas to all government universities based on the list of graduates from universities. MEC staff interviewed two applicants from Jawzjan and Kapisa provinces who received their diplomas from the respective provinces and brought the diplomas for the approval of the Ministry. The applicants were satisfied with the issuance process.
84	Distribution of diplomas begun in private universities.	84.1	MOHE	All private universities in coordination with MOHE begin distribution of diplomas	(30 Sep. 2014) - Distributing diplomas to graduates of private higher education institutes is an unsolved challenge and authorities in the ministry have not paid proper attention to it.	(30 June 2015) - The process of diploma distribution for graduates of private universities has started. MOHE sends the soft-copy of the diploma designed specifically for private universities to the relevant universities. The universities fill in the soft version and sends it back to the MOHE for issuing the hard copy. MEC has received a copy of a blank diploma designed for private university graduates.
85	Unoccupied positions linked to the diploma issuance process filled	85.1	MOHE	MOHE fills unoccupied positions linked to the certificate issuance process during the financial year so that the workload pressure on staff is lowered and the process is speeded up		(30 June 2015) - All positions in the Directorate of Students and Graduates Affairs are occupied, except the positions of the deputy directors, which are currently at the short-list stage at IARCSC.
86	A computerized document management system developed	86.1	MOHE	MOHE guidelines incorporate the whole process of receiving diplomas		(31 Dec. 2015) - A procedure for receiving diploma has been published in the collection of Regulations, Laiha and Procedures of the MOHE which is also available on the website of the ministry. Additionally, MEC Secretariat has received a copy of the guideline, which covers the process from filling the application form to receiving the diploma
87	Guideline developed, published and accessible to public via websites.	87.1	MOHE	Expansion of access to guidelines to allow all universities and public to MOHE websites		(31 Dec. 2015) - MOHE has published a collection of 5 Regulations, 12 Laiha, 6 Procedures and 2 Guidelines in circulated the hart copy to all universities and academic institutions. This collection is also available on the MOHE homepage. <a href="http://www.mohe.gov.af">www.mohe.gov.af</a>

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
88	Development of Higher Education Law with participation from relevant government and civil society stakeholders and universities	88.1	MOHE	MOHE in consultation with MOFA, MOJ, MOE, representatives of government and private universities and civil society draft the Higher Education Law	(30 Sep. 2013) - The Higher Education Law has not been approved by the Parliament on the pretext of title selection such as Pohantoon and Danishgah, Pohanyar and Danishyar.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The new Higher Education Law has been enacted on October 31 2015 and published in the Official Gazette Nr. 1195.
89	Higher Education Law approved	89.1	MOHE	Parliament gives priority to the approval and finalization of the Higher Education Law		(31 Dec. 2015) - The new Higher Education Law has been enacted on October 31 2015 and published in the Official Gazette Nr. 1195.
90	Set up a unified standard curriculum for all academic institutions.	90.1	MOHE	The Ministry of Higher Education in consultation with the universities set up a unified, market based standard curriculum for all academic institutions and introduces a unified credit system.	(30 Sep. 2013) - There is a variety of classic and credit point based systems at the country's universities.	(31 Dec. 2015) - Public universities and higher education institutions are already using the Credit System. Also, all private universities apply the Credit System. MEC Secretariat has visited the Medical Faculty of the Kabul University and the Afghanistan Higher Education Institution which have already introduced the credit point system. Additionally, a unified curriculum has been prepared by MOHE and sent to all universities for implementation.
91	A thorough assessment of universities' organizational needs conducted.	91.1	MOHE	MOHE conducts an assessment of universities' organizational needs for the implementation of the credit system.	(30 Sep. 2013) - Organizational structure deficiencies and the lack of teachers in universities (particularly in those that use the credit system) has obliged professors to teach extra hours as well as instruct courses not in their field of expertise.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The organisational structure of the universities is based on the needs and the legal documents. Universities conduct an assessment of their organisational structure annually and submit their proposals for filling the structural gaps to MOHE. Subsequently, the ministry analyses the proposals and take appropriate measures. Besides, the Credit System has been introduced based on the unified curriculum in all universities and higher education institutions. To assure quality and credibility of the structures of universities and higher education institutions, 2 legal documents are applicable: Quality Assurance Laiha and Procedure for Evaluation of Academic, Administrative and Structural Standards of Universities and Higher Education Institutions.
92	Consolidate present legal documents related to the exam process.	92.1	MOHE	The Ministry of Higher Education in consultation with the universities consolidates the present legal documents pertaining to the exams process.	(30 Sep. 2013) - The existence of several documents causes ambiguities, which allow officials and teachers to escape their responsibilities.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The legal documents of the exam process include the new Higher Education Law, Procedure of the Entrance Examination for higher and semi-higher Education Institution, Examination Procedure of higher Education Institution, Procedure of Enrollment of Technical and Vocational Schools Graduates at Universities which are applicable. The above mentioned legal documents have been shared with MEC and are available on the ministry's homepage.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
93	Hiring conditions for lecturers in universities revised.	93.1	MOHE	MOHE revises the hiring conditions of lecturers in universities.	(30 Sep. 2013) - The current hiring procedure does not encourage those with a higher educational degree (Master or PhD) to start an academic carrier as a lecturer.	(31 Dec. 2015) - MOHE has revised the hiring conditions of universities lecturers. Chapter 4 of the new Higher Education Law regulates the hiring conditions of university lecturers in Articles 34 - 51. The recruitment and approval of universities lecturers are particularly stipulated in Articles 37, 38 and 39 of the new Law.
94	Higher education for lecturers facilitated.	94.1	MOHE	MOHE sends teachers with BAs abroad to obtain postgraduate degrees	(30 Sep. 2013) -The limited professional capacity of university teachers and their unfamiliarity with the new teaching methods causes discontent amongst the students.	(30 June 2015) - Within the capacity building framework, university teachers are sent abroad for short- and long-term scholarships. MEC Secretariat has received the list of teachers who were sent abroad for receiving their Masters degree and PhD. Additionally, university teachers of some faculties e.g. Shariah Law, Education and Management are provided the opportunity to obtain their masters degree in Afghanistan.
95	The quality of teaching of all universities enhanced	95.1	MOHE	MOHE enhances the quality of teaching at all universities and sends a circular ordering the enforcement of academic accountability of teachers in a fixed time frame.	(30 Sep 2013) - Some teachers are not professional in their conduct towards students, either during exams or the rest of the semester.	(30 June 2015) - To ensure the quality control of the teachings at universities there are the procedure of quality assurance and the procedure of Evaluation of Scientific, Administrative and Organisational Standards which are currently applicable, according to MOHE. However, since the academic accountability of the teachers is stipulated in Articles 39 of the Higher Education Law, there is no need for a circular.
96	The implementation process of the order monitored.	96.1	MOHE	MOHE in cooperation with the leadership of universities and other higher education institutes, monitor the implementation process of the order.		(30 June 2015) - The academic accountability of the teachers is stipulated in Articles 39 of the Higher Education Law.
97	The monitoring policy considering harassment and discrimination cases strengthened and maintained.	97.1	MOHE	MOHE strengthens the monitoring policy considering harassment and discrimination cases.	(30 Sep. 2013) - Some teachers misuse the exams as a tool to achieve their own agenda, misusing exams for immoral issues or tribal, language, political and religious prejudices	(31 Dec. 2015 - MOHE has developed and published an harassment prevention policy called "Policy on Prohibition of Discrimination and Sexual Harassment" which is being distributed to all Universities for implementation. A copy of the policy has been shared with MEC. Additionally, the gender department of the MOHE is established for conducting awareness workshops and seminars in order to reduce harassment of girls. Gender units have been established at 18 universities and 25 academic institutions which is expanding.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
98	A proper monitoring mechanism developed.	98.1	MOHE	Universities and higher education institutes develop a monitoring mechanism to report quarterly to MOHE and ensure implementation of the relevant policies, laws and regulations	(30 Sep. 2013) - The lack of monitoring the process by the designated authorities allows teachers to think that the legal documents need not be implemented.	(30 June 2015) - There is a monitoring mechanism in place which requires all universities to submit their activity reports to the Directorate of University Affairs of MOHE. This Directorate compiles an aggregated report and submits it to the Minister. MEC has received samples of the activity reports of Kandahar, Herat and Nangrahar Universities and the aggregated report. According to the received reports, the monitoring teams of the M&E Unit of MOHE monitor the activity of all universities. Additionally, monitoring the activities of the faculties is part of the Universities Directorates' ToRs.
99	Qualified and accountable individuals recruited for archiving students' documents and exam grades	99.1	MOHE	Universities make sure that qualified and accountable people are recruited for the archiving of students' documents and grades in the exams section.	(30 Sep. 2013) - The falsification of documents and information related to the exams process is easily possible in the Faculty Academic Management Unit and thus represents a vulnerability to corruption.	(31 Dec. 2015) - According to the MOHE all positions are filled with qualified and accountable applicants based on the TOR through a competitive process which also include representatives of the IARCSC and the relevant Department. Additionally, new recruits have to sign a declaration of agreement to respect the confidentiality of classified documents. All universities have a students affairs manager and all faculties have an Educational Department (Tadrissi), who are responsible for archiving the documents and exam scores. The TOR of mentioned positions are shared with MEC.
100	Individual access to the documents and information limited	100.1	MOHE	Universities should deny individual access to documents and information.	(30 Sep. 2013) - The falsification of documents and information related to the exams process is easily possible in the Faculty Academic Management Unit and thus represents a vulnerability to corruption.	(31 Dec. 2015) - All universities have a Department of Students affairs and each faculty has an Educational Department. Only these departments have access to the documents. Additionally, new appointees must submit their written commitment regarding the confidentiality of their work. According to their TOR, monitoring and controlling the enrollment and graduation documents and the insertion of exam scores are part of their jobs.
101	Attendance sheets and the process of enrolment of private universities monitored	101.1	MOHE	MOHE should monitor the attendance sheets and the process of enrolment of private universities to mitigate fraudulent issuance of documents.	(30 Sep. 2013) - In most of private universities, students enroll without taking the entrance exams and graduate without attendance.	(30 June 2015) - The representatives of MOHE are present during the enrolment exam of the private universities to monitor the process. Regarding the attendance of students, taking the final exam is denied, if a student does not participate in at least 75 % of the lectures. The attendance sheet is regularly shared with the MOHE.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
102	Infrastructure project of refugee's residential town implemented	102.1	MORR	Ministries and entities mentioned in Presidential Decree 104 assess and identify the factors causing delays in the implementation of infrastructure and development projects in refugees' residential towns	(30 Oct. 2013) - The MORR, as the main body for decree implementation, has not developed any procedure that could explicitly apply provisions of the decree.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The MORR has signed MOUs with 13 relevant ministries and institutions regarding the implementation of infrastructure projects. In this regards some achievements have been made: for example, in the Khalilullah Khalili residential town in Kabul 3 Schools have been built by MOE, 2 hospitals by MOHE and 3 mosques by MOHRA. In the Qalamwal residential town in Khost, a girls school has been built by MOE and 20 Wells by MRRD. Additionally, a joint technical committee was established with the participation of MAIL, MUDA, IDLG, ARAZI, as well as the Senior Advisor of the President. The committee has appointed a delegation consisting of the provincial directorates of ARAZI, MORR and MUDA on 16th of July 2015 to analyze the refugee's residential towns and report to the committee. The Analysis has been conducted in Kabul, Parwan, Panjshir, Farah, Wardak, Sar e Pul, Laghman and Nangrahar provinces and is in progress in other provinces as well. According to their findings of the delegation, the major problems causing the delay in the infrastructure projects of refugee's residential towns are: lack of security, lack of groundwater storage, long distances of the residential towns to the cities, lack of sufficient development budget and usurpation of land by powerful people.
103	The process of land distribution for repatriates and displaced started and fairly distributed	103.1	MORR	MORR distributes land for repatriates and displaced in accordance with their policy	(30 Oct. 2013) - To date, the Ministry has distributed more than 54,782 pieces of shelter within 62 residential towns throughout the country.	(31 Dec. 2015) - After the approval of the Procedure for Land Distribution on 19th of May 2015, 1534 plots has been distributed to returnees and repatriates in Parwan, Bamyan, Daikundi, Jozjan, Logar and Bankh provinces. Some documents of the distributed plots have been shared with MEC.
104	Effective investigation and prosecution of 3,500 shelters distribution initiated.	104.1	MORR/AGO	Attorney General's Office and Supreme Audit Office jointly investigate the distribution of 3,500 shelters in refugees' housing schemes in Kabul and provinces.	(30 Oct. 2013) - At least 3,500 shelters in refugees' housing schemes have been distributed to more than one deserving applicant in Kabul province, which has caused conflicts among recipients.	(31 Dec. 2015) - MORR has referred cases of delinquency and cases with criminal implications to the AGO, including the land distribution case in Kabul province, and shared the related documents with MEC. For example, the former deputy minister, the director of refugees affairs of Kabul province, the head of admin and finance unit and the manager of reintegration unit of Kabul province have been referred to AGO and are currently under investigation. Additionally, MORR's legal committee has taken some measures to deal with the issue of 3,500 shelters. As a result, the Ministry has addressed the complaints and distributed 800 plots to eligible applicants. Further, the MORR is planning to solve the problems of 2.700 applicants in 1394 by allocating them pieces of residential land in GOSPAN DARA of Kabul.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
105	Recruitment and appointment processes implemented based on merit and qualifications	105.1	MORR	MORR in coordination with IARCSC recruit qualified staff in vacant positions, and identify unqualified, uncommitted and corrupt officials through annual performance appraisal	(30 Oct. 2013) - Lack of professional, talented, honest, committed and capable employees is making the process of land distribution vulnerable to corruption. There are still positions that are vacant and some staff members are working temporarily.	(31 Dec. 2015) - In the first three quarters of 1393, 100 vacant positions (50 in Kabul and 50 in provinces) were filled through fair competitions. The ministry filled 9 vacant positions with the support of IARCSC through a competitive process and announced 20 more in the second half of the solar year 1394. Eight positions of grade 2 and 3 are currently under process through the CBRF and 12 positions have been filled in the provincial Directorates of the Ministry through a competitive process. Additionally, a performance review of 57 employees have been conducted which resulted in the promotion of 15 employees and training requirements for one employee of grade three. The related documents have been shared with MEC Secretariat.
106	Annual performance appraisal to identify unqualified, uncommitted and corrupt officials conducted	106.1	MORR	MORR implements staffing procedures and observes recruitment principles	(30 Oct. 2013) - There is unprofessional behavior of high-ranking employees with low-ranking staff members, the misuse of job descriptions, and transfers and unjustifiable appointments at the Ministry.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The recruitment and annual performance evaluation of all employees have been conducted in accordance with IARCSC guidelines. Performance review of 57 employees have been conducted recently which resulted in the promotion of 15 employees and training requirements for one employee of grade three. The related documents have been shared with MEC Secretariat.
107	Technical, managerial and anti-corruption training program conducted.	107.1	MORR	MORR in cooperation with IARCSC deliver professional training program for relevant staff.		(30 June 2015) - 335 employees of the ministry in Kabul and provinces have received trainings in management, the Civil Servant's Code of Conduct, diplomacy, computer skills, database management, proposal writing, procurement, ethics, HR and English language. A copy of the list of participants have been shared with MEC. MEC Secretariat has observed some of the training sessions including English and computer courses.
108	Establishment of daily electronic reporting mechanism.	108.1	MORR	The MORR establishes a daily electronic reporting mechanism in the document and information management system	(30 Oct. 2013) - The employees involved in the process are not using the database system properly and still keep documents in a disorganized manner. This has resulted in clients losing documents.	(31 Dec. 2015) - Currently, all provincial directorates have access to internet and submit their reports through email on a daily basis. Additionally, a central database has been established, which is not connected to the provincial directorates yet. Copies of some of daily report has been shared with MEC's Secretariat.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
109	Comprehensive legal framework designed	109.1	MORR	The MORR designs a comprehensive legal framework regarding duties and responsibilities of MORR and develops comprehensive procedure covering all areas of work related to land distribution.	(30 Oct. 2013) MoRR as the main organ for the implementation of Presidential Decree 104 has not developed any procedure that could explicitly apply provisions of the decree. This issue has resulted in a variety of interpretations of the decree, delays in its application, as well as continued corruption and injustice within the land distribution process.	(31 Dec. 2015) - A comprehensive Regulation called "Regulation on the Activities and Operations of MORR" which was covered in the first 100-day plan of the Ministry, has been finalized. Additionally, the procedure for land distribution has been developed and approved. MEC Secretariat has received a copy of the procedure and regulations.
110	Multilateral agreements developed and signed	110.1	MORR	MORR develops and signs multilateral agreements with involved entities mentioned in Presidential Decree 104 to ensure the coordination of all efforts related to the affairs of the refugees' housing schemes.	(30 Oct. 2013) - Lack of coordination among ministries and responsible organs mentioned in Presidential Decree 104 causes delayed implementation of infrastructure and development projects in refugee housing schemes and land distribution to eligible applicants.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The High Commission of Refugees and Repatriates Affairs is established under the chairmanship of the President and with participation of 19 Ministries and General Directorates. The TORs of the Commission have also been developed and the first session has been conducted on 21 June 2015 under the chairmanship of the President. Additionally, a technical committee has been established under the chairmanship of MORR with the participation of MAIL, MUDA, ARAZI, MRRD, IDLG and Board of the New Kabul City to provide affordable housing with long term mortgage loans and pave the way for the settlement of returnees in New Kabul City and suburbs.
111	Current legislative documents reviewed and amended, and Articles 10 and 21 of Civil Servants Pension regulating bylaw aligned with Article 141 of Labor Law	111.1	MOLSAMD	MOLSAMD and the IARCSC, in coordination with the Ministry of Justice, take serious action to review and rectify the current contradictions and vagueness in the legislative documents of the pension process	(30 Oct. 2013) - Contradictions in some articles of the Labor Law and the by-law regulating civil servant pensions results in administrative corruption. For instance, the conflict between article 141 of the Labour Law and articles 10 and 21 of the by-law regulating civil servant pensions.	(30 June 2015) - The Civil Servants Pension Regulating by-law has been amended and promulgated in the Official Gazette #1128 and shared with MEC. Article 10 has been aligned with Article 141 of the Labour Law and Article 21 of the regulation has been nullified. Additionally, Article 6.1.5, Article 6.5, Article 11, Article 14, Article 17, Article 18 and Article 22 of the Civil Servants Pension Regulation has been amended.
112	Articles 21, 3 and 24 of pension bylaw identified as vulnerable to administrative corruption and modified	112.1	MOLSAMD	Modify articles which have been identified as vulnerable to administrative corruption, replace them with appropriate ones	(30 Oct. 2013) - The multiplication factors of 1.4%, 1.7% and 2% in article 21 of the by-law regulating pensions are complex and can contribute to injustice and corruption in the pension process. Article 24 of the civil service by-law regulating pensions discusses the Complaints Appeal Commission for retirees and the appointment of its members. There is no member of the retiree's association in the commission.	(30 June 2015) - The Civil Servants Pension Regulating bylaw has been amended and promulgated in the Official Gazette 1128. Article 24 has not been implemented.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
113	All previous presidential decrees against law explicitly abrogated	113.1	MOLSAMD	Abrogate all previous presidential decrees which are in contradiction with pension legal frame work.	(30 Oct. 2013) - The number of legal documents causes confusion for staff and applicants and has paved the way for misuse.	(30 June 2015) - MOLSAMD has merged two norms which were based on two Presidential Decrees in order to provide better services to retirees. Additionally, all Presidential Decrees and Resolutions which were violating the pension legal frame work have been abrogated. Examples of the abrogated Decrees and Resolutions include: Resolution No. 18 of the Council of Ministers dated 28.04.1388 regarding expansion of pension benefits, Decree No. 3030 dated 12.05.1392 regarding teachers aged at least 65 years and decree No. 1982 regarding retirement of employees who have served at least 40 years. Copies of the abrogated Decrees have been shared with MEC.
114	Corrupt officials detected and prosecuted	114.1	MOLSAMD	MOLSAMD identifies corrupt staff and introduces them to AGO for investigation and prosecution		(30 June 2015) - The number of cases referred to the AGO based on the findings of the internal audit after the approval of the Minister are: 1391 - 6 Cases 1392 - 18 Cases 1393 - 7 Cases The referred cases include: Difference in the value of 13 procured good of 630,000 Afs in 1392, Difference in the IT contract of 733,462 Afs due to ex-post changes in the offer in 1392, rewarding a scholarship to a person who was not employee of the Ministry and finally some cases of receiving pension benefits based on faked documents. The report of the referred cases have been shared with MEC.
115	Satisfactory working environment provided in GDPT	115.1	MOLSAMD	General Directorate of Pension Treasury (GDPT), in coordination with the MOLSAMD, provide a satisfactory working environment for its staff and make efforts to improve the current situation.	(10 Dec. 2014) - The current working conditions and the provision of services at GDPT are unsatisfactory.	(30 June 2015) - To improve the working environment, the General Directorate of Pension Treasury has taken the following measures: Repairing the building of the GDPT and aligning the inside structure of the building with the requirements of the offices and establishing a waiting room for the customers, Simplification of the procedures e.g. the introduction of the new computerized system of the pension process which prevents building long waiting lines. Raising awareness of the retirees through awareness campaigns (Publicity Campaign Project) which is funded by the World Bank. The project includes banners on the walls, issuing brochures, televised adds and oral information sharing but has not started yet.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
116	Existing electronic system of Pension Department strengthened	116.1	MOLSAMD	MOLSAMD strengthens the new electronic pension process system by identifying obstacles and dealing with them	(30 Oct. 2013) - The existence of the old and new systems and the lack of familiarity of the existing methods and lengthy and complicated bureaucracy have made the process time consuming.	(30 June 2015) - The new electronic system has completely substituted the analog system. The new system is applicable since the beginning of 1394 in Kabul. 47,000 Retirees have been included in the new system and receive their retirement pay in their bank accounts. The remaining 40,000 - 45,000 will be included by the end of 1394. The new system is planned to cover all provinces by end of 2017 in which case the provincial directorates will be electronically connected with the centre. All seven forms of the pension process have been incorporated in the new system and they are digitally interconnected. MEC Secretariat has received the flowchart of the new computerized process and observed the new process and the computerized system.
117	Training programs for pension administration employees conducted	117.1	MOLSAMD	Conduct a training program to improve the capacities and competencies of the staff of the Pension Department and make sure that they are able to use the new system	(30 Oct. 2013) - Although the reform project has made some contributions towards enhancing capacity building, a certain number of trained staff of this directorate has been replaced by authorities of the ministry for unknown reasons.	(30 June 2015) - Trainings on the application of the new system have been conducted by the (Pension Administration & Safety Net Project) staff to all 75 employees of the GDPA. Additionally, representatives of 60 government institutions have been trained on the new retirement forms and the new system. Of those 60 institutions, 15 are already connected online with GDPA. The other government institution will be incorporated when they are prepared. The trainings are conducted in two phases, first in the classroom and secondly on-job trainings. The list of the GDPA employees and other government institutions who received trainings was shared with MEC.
118	One stop shop approach to deal with retirees established	118.1	MOLSAMD	Establish one stop shop approach	(30 Oct. 2013) - The lengthy and complicated bureaucracy have made the process time consuming.	(30 June 2015) - The one stop shop approach has been established to provide services which requires the retirees to come in person only in two stages: first for submitting the documents and secondly for receiving the Pension ID. After receiving the Pension ID, the retiree receives its retirement pay in his bank account. The challenges that the one-stop shop was facing e.g. lack of support of the leadership, lack of electricity and HR are solved now.
119	Electronic management system developed and pension related documents incorporated	119.1	MOLSAMD	MOLSAMD develops an electronic mechanism to manage the documents and data and start data entry according to the new system	(30 Oct. 2013) - The current document and data management system is vulnerable since it is not an electronic system.	(30 June 2015) - The electronic management system has been established and the data entry has been completed which covers all 164,000 retirees. MEC Secretariat has visited the new database.
120	Coordination with relevant government agencies in implementation and processing MOI pension issues further improved	120.1	MOI/MOLSAMD	MOI (Pension Department) further improves cooperation and coordination with MOLSAMD (Pension Department) in running with all pension claims	(30 May 2014) - There are significant delays in processing MOI pensions due to a lack of coordination.	(30 June 2015) - Starting in 1394 with the implementation of the new computerized system in GDPA, the cooperation between GDPA and MOI has improved notably. All information of the retirees of the MOI are included in the new database. The retirement pay of the MOI is being processed through the new computerized procedure without any delays

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
121	Precise assessments conducted and immediate action taken to improve the <b>Retirement System Reform Project</b> implementation	121.1	MOLSAMD	MoLSAMD, in coordination with managers of the project, conduct precise assessments and take immediate action to improve project implementation.	(30 Oct. 2013) - Creation of obstacles in the implementation of the project, lack of sufficient interest in implementing this project on due time and sabotage of the new system are some of the examples that are hindering the implementation of the new system.	(30 June 2015) - The new leadership of MOLSAMD has evaluated the problems and challenges facing the (Pension Administration & Safety Net) project and has taken measures to address them. As a result, the project has been implemented which includes the one-stop shop approach, a new computerized procedure of the pension process and a new database for the pension documents.
122	Redundant or parallel structures reduced to minimize discretionary transactions and improved redress mechanisms.	122.1	MOLSAMD	MOLSAMD, in coordination with AIRCSC, establishes a joint complaints board to ensure that all clients have a reliable redress mechanism and dissolves the Fact Finding Commission	(30 May 2015) - Fact Finding Commission is redundant and compels disabled persons in provinces to come to Kabul. Currently no complaints board exists	(31 Dec. 2015) - The new leadership of MOLSAMD has dissolved the Fact Finding Commission and established the Documents Evaluation Commission with the membership of NDS, Criminal Department of MOI as well as the Representative of MOPH, the Disabled Union and Civil Society. The same commission has been established in provinces as well. The minutes of a session of the mentioned commission has been shared with MEC, which covers the TOR of the commission and the process of verification of martyr families and the degree of disability of disabled persons.
123	Administrative and Performance Law developed with participation from the relevant government and civil society stakeholders	123.1	IARCSC	Enact the Administrative and Performance Law with the cooperation of relevant stakeholders, including the IARCSC, OAA, MOJ, MOLSAMD, IDLG, MOF, AGO, courts, municipalities, and civil society	(30 Oct. 2013) - There is no Administrative and Performance Law in place.	(31 Dec. 2015) - The legislative and policy units of the IARCSC has prepared and sent the Draft Administrative Procedure Law to MOJ for scrutiny and further process.
124	The legal documents of the recruitment process aligned with the Constitution and Basic Structure Law	124.1	IARCSC	IARCSC in coordination with the Ministry of Labour and Ministry of Justice aligns the legal documents of the process with the Constitution and Basic Structure Law in such a way that the shortcomings are eliminated		(31 Dec. 2015) - The recruitment process of the civil servants is in accordance with The Civil Service Law and the Civil Servants Law. Both laws have been enacted in light of Article 50 of the Constitution. Additionally, the Procedure for the Recruitment of Civil Servants and its Monitoring has been prepared and approved based on the Civil Servants Law. A copy of the mentioned procedure has been shared with MEC
125	Clear HR management procedure developed and implemented	125.1	IARCSC	IARCSC in coordination with MOLSAMD, MOCIT, MOF and other governmental agencies develop and implement an inter-ministerial (HR-MIS) database	(30 Oct. 2013) - There is no HR electronic data and document management system at the ministries.	(30 June 2015) - IARCSC has launched the HR-MIS system in 38 ministries/ government institutions. Ministries/ government institutions conduct a joint meeting every two weeks for sharing information and implementation of the HR-MIS system. Agenda copy of a few of the stakeholders HR-MIS meetings has been shared with MEC

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
126	An inter-ministerial (HR-MIS) database developed and implemented	126.1	IARCSC	IARCSC in cooperation with MOLSAMD develop procedures for all institutions on how to utilize the database		(30 June 2015) - IARCSC has created a comprehensive guideline for using the HR-MIS system in every ministry/ institution. A copy of the guideline has been shared with MEC.
127	HR management database linked and accessible by all state institutions	127.1	IARCSC	Expansion of access to HR management system to all state ministries and institutions		(30 June 2015) - The HRMIS system is implemented in 38 ministries/government institutions. A copy of the data collection for civil servants within HR-MIS system has been shared with MEC.
		127.2	IARCSC	Database developed that includes staff personnel records, promotions and retirement data		(30 June 2015) - The current HR-MIS includes personal data, employment history and civil servant promotions. MEC Secretariat has observed the database during a verification visit and received an exemplary copy of one civil service employee.
128	The Licensed National Pharmaceutical Products List is updated and published	128.1	MOPH	The updated Licensed National Pharmaceutical Products List must be reviewed and updated in accordance with the needs based on the existing diseases in the country. This will avoid the import of unlisted pharmaceuticals.	(22. Sep. 2014) - The Licensed National Pharmaceutical Products List provides incentives to bribe officials to allow the import of unlisted products. The List has not been updated for seven years.	(30 June 2015) - The National Pharmaceutical Products List dated 1393 is on the homepage of the Directorate of Pharmaceutical Affairs.
129	The number of qualified staff with pharmaceutical backgrounds in the process of importation, pharmaceutical services and monitoring increased.	129.1	MOPH	Mid-term professional trainings developed and implemented to enhance the capacity of the Food and Drugs Quality Control (FDQC) Department.		(30 June 2015) - Based on the conducted needs assessment the FDQC Department planned med-term professional trainings and master programs in cooperation with the Health Project of the World Bank. These programs include trainings on physiochemics, micro-biology, toxicology, bio-chemistry, herbal medicine, cosmetics and lab-management which will start within the first 100 days. Six employees are planned to be sent abroad for attaining their Masters Degree.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
130	The registration and licensing of pharmaceutical importation companies reformed	130.1	MOPH	Creation of data collection system to accurately balance supply with broader public health goals and inform planning processes.		(30 June 2015) - A Pharmaceuticals Needs Estimation Guideline has been developed and shared with MEC. According to Article 19.3 of the draft Pharmaceutical Law, the national annual needs estimation of medicine and medical products is conducted by the National Pharmaceutical Regulating Authority. Additionally, a database for collecting statistical information on pharmaceuticals for public and private sector has also been created and is operational since mid 1392. MEC secretariat has seen the database.
		130.2	MOPH	An investment promotion policy developed to promote the establishment of medicine production factories in Afghanistan in order to reduce the import of pharmaceuticals and achieve independence in a specified time.		(30 June 2015) - GDPA has developed a Strategic Plan (2014 - 2020) and shared it with MEC. The Strategic Plan is finalized and approved by MOPH. The strategic plan is aiming at enhancing the national production of pharmaceuticals by attracting investments through funding opportunities, tax exemptions and other incentives. The implementation of this plan will require high level of cooperation from other government entities, e.g. AISA, MOF etc.
131	The Registration system of foreign pharmaceutical production companies reformed and standardized in order to enhance quality of imported pharmaceuticals	131.1	MOPH	Annual evaluation of the quality of pharmaceuticals produced by foreign companies and approval/denial of license based on the results of the evaluation	(22. Sep. 2014) - There is a lack of transparent criteria for the registration of foreign companies, a lack of capacity to examine and monitor the quality of pharmaceuticals in compliance with WHO criteria, and weaknesses in the ability of MOPH to oversee these companies.	(30 June 2015) - The new Registration Guideline for Foreign Companies has been approved and shared with MEC. The objective of this Guideline is to establish a transparent procedure for the registration of foreign companies and prevent the production of low quality pharmaceuticals.
		131.2	MOPH	Specific and transparent criteria established for approval/denial of licenses for producing pharmaceuticals based on a specified policy		(31 Dec. 2015) - The new Registration Guideline for Foreign Pharmaceutical Production Companies has been prepared and finalized and is available on the GDPA homepage. This guideline contains specific criteria for approval, denial and suspension of licenses. E.g. the license can be abrogated if the registered foreign company doesn't import any of the listed pharmaceuticals for 3 consecutive years or the foreign company produces at least 3 different medical products of low quality or the company does not comply with the GOOD MANUFACTURING PRACTICES FOR PHARMACEUTICAL PRODUCTS developed by the GDPA based on the WHO best practice.

No.	Indicator	No.	Inst.	Recommendation	Baseline	Status
132	Increased efforts by the international community to transfer responsibilities for development programs to the Afghan government.	132.1	IARCSC	IARCSC & MoF intensify their efforts to accelerate pay-grade reforms and ensure that the advisory panel on senior appointments and the Independent Administrative Reform and Civil Service Commission (IARCSC) are effective, fair, and transparent.	(30. Dec. 2014) Multiple sources report that the panel on senior appointments and the IARCSC are not adequately fulfilling their responsibilities to employ fair, transparent, and merit-based processes.	(31 Dec. 2015) - IARCSC has completed the pay-grade system in all government institutions except MOFA and AGO. The advisory panel on senior appointments was never under the authority of IARCSC but was working directly for the President. Only positions of grade 1 and 2 of civil servants were under the authority of the appointment board, where the board currently has only an observing board.